



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 18, 2017

Mr. Flint Matzke
Assistant County Attorney
Brazos County
300 East 26th Street, Suite 1300
Bryan, Texas 77803-5327

OR2017-16057

Dear Mr. Matzke:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 666900.

The Brazos County Attorney's Office (the "county attorney's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified case. You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for some of the submitted body camera recordings. As the body worn camera recordings we have indicated were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b). However, as the requestor provided the requisite information for the remaining body worn camera recordings, we will address your arguments for this information.

Next, we note the remaining information includes court-filed documents which are subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record” unless it is “made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). You seek to withhold this information under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. However, sections 552.103 and 552.108 are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that do not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the county attorney’s office may not withhold the court-filed documents under section 552.103 or section 552.108. As no other exceptions to disclosure are raised, the court-filed documents we have marked must be released pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. However, we will consider your arguments for the remaining information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state release of the remaining information will interfere with a pending criminal prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable in this instance. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). We note,

however, the information at issue includes a DIC-24 statutory warning and a DIC-25 notice of suspension. The county attorney's office provided a copy of these forms to the arrestee. You have not explained how releasing this information, which has already been seen by the arrestee, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1).

Additionally, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic "front-page" information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to "include be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which you state you have released, and the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the county attorney's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

Next, we address your argument under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Section 552.103 provides:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984,

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

We note the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information related to litigation through the discovery process. *See* ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, any information obtained from or provided to all other parties in the anticipated or pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. The submitted DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms were provided to the arrestee; thus, the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms were inevitably seen by the opposing party to the litigation. Furthermore, basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Therefore, the county attorney's office may not withhold the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms or basic information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."² Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the county attorney's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked in the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, the county attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked in the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, pursuant to section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code, the submitted body worn camera recordings we have indicated were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code and need not be released to the requestor. With the exception of the court-filed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which we have marked, the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, and basic information, the county

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

attorney's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms, the county attorney's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'SMP', written over a light blue horizontal line.

Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/sdk

Ref: ID# 666900

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)