



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 14, 2017

Mr. Ricardo R. Lopez  
Counsel for North East Independent School District  
Schulman, Lopez, Hoffer, and Adelstein, L.L.P.  
517 Soledad Street  
San Antonio, Texas 78205-1508

OR2017-15758

Dear Mr. Lopez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 666264.

The North East Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for six categories of information pertaining to a named district employee and a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.114 and 552.116 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have not submitted any information responsive to the request for (1) specified procedures for non-certified staff, (2) evaluations and rebuttals of the named employee, or (3) memos, directives, or reprimands to the named employee. To the extent any information responsive to these portions of the request existed on the date the district received the request, we assume the district has released it. If the district has not released any such information, it must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Next, we note the United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office has informed this office the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code, does not permit state and local

educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental or an adult student's consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act.<sup>1</sup> Consequently, state and local educational authorities that receive a request for education records from a member of the public under the Act must not submit education records to this office in unredacted form, that is, in a form in which "personally identifiable information" is disclosed. *See* 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining "personally identifiable information"); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 224 (1979) (student's handwritten comments protected under FERPA because they would make identity of student easily traceable through handwriting, style of expression, or particular incidents related in the comments). You assert FERPA applies to portions of the requested documents. Because our office is prohibited from reviewing records to determine whether appropriate redactions under FERPA have been made, we do not address the applicability of FERPA. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(1)(A). Such determinations under FERPA must be made by the district. Likewise, we do not address your argument under section 552.114 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.026 (incorporating FERPA into the Act), 552.114 (excepting from disclosure "student records"); Open Records Decision No. 539 (1990) (determining the same analysis applies under section 552.114 of the Government Code and FERPA). However, we will consider your remaining argument against disclosure of the requested information.

Section 552.116 of the Government Code provides,

(a) An audit working paper of an audit of the state auditor or the auditor of a state agency, an institution of higher education as defined by Section 61.003, Education Code, a county, a municipality, a school district, a hospital district, or a joint board operating under Section 22.074, Transportation Code, including any audit relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, is excepted from [required public disclosure]. If information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from [public disclosure] by this section.

(b) In this section:

(1) "Audit" means an audit authorized or required by a statute of this state or the United States, the charter or an ordinance of a municipality, an order of the commissioners court of a county, the bylaws adopted by or other action of the governing board of a hospital district, a resolution or other action of a board of trustees of a school district, including an audit by the district relating to the criminal

---

<sup>1</sup>A copy of this letter may be found on the Office of the Attorney General's website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/files/og/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

history background check of a public school employee, or a resolution or other action of a joint board described by Subsection (a) and includes an investigation.

(2) "Audit working paper" includes all information, documentary or otherwise, prepared or maintained in conducting an audit or preparing an audit report, including:

(A) intra-agency and interagency communications; and

(B) drafts of the audit report or portions of those drafts.

Gov't Code § 552.116. You state the submitted information consists of audit working papers prepared or maintained in the course of an investigation authorized by district policies adopted by the district's school board. Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated most of the submitted information constitutes audit working papers. *See id.* Accordingly, except for the e-mail we marked, the district may withhold the submitted information under section 552.116 of the Government Code. However, in this case, the requestor specifically seeks a specified e-mail from a parent to the district. Upon review, we find the e-mail at issue, which we marked, is maintained independently of the audit working papers. Section 552.116 does not apply to records that exist independently of the audit working papers. *See id.* § 552.116(a) (if information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from public disclosure by section 552.116). Accordingly, the district may not withhold the e-mail we marked under section 552.116 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c).<sup>2</sup> *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the personal e-mail address we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.

In summary, except for the e-mail we marked, the district may withhold the submitted information under section 552.116 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the personal e-mail address we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure. The district must release the remaining information.

---

<sup>2</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RAA/bw

Ref: ID# 666264

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)