



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 12, 2017

Mr. Whitt L. Wyatt  
Counsel for the City of Glenn Heights  
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.  
500 North Akard Street, Suite 1800  
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2017-15543

Dear Mr. Wyatt:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 672933 (City Ref. Nos. 87257 and 87429).

The Glenn Heights Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received three requests from different requestors for information related to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007(c) makes confidential juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. The relevant language of section 58.007 reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). Thus, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, the department must generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note, however, the submitted information includes a CR-3 accident report. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 of the Transportation Code applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator’s accident report), .062 (officer’s accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the third requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the submitted accident report is confidential under section 550.065(b) with respect to the third requestor, and the department must withhold it from the first requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, section 550.065(c-1) requires the department to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.*

Thus, although the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code with respect to the third requestor, section 550.065(c-1) requires the redacted accident report to be released to the third requestor. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the right of access provided under section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W. 2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). In this instance, although section 58.007(c) generally pertains to all juvenile law enforcement records, section 550.065(c-1) specifically provides access only to redacted accident reports of the type at issue. Therefore, we conclude the access to redacted accident reports provided under section 550.065(c-1) is more specific than, and prevails over, section 58.007(c). Thus, the department may not withhold the redacted CR-3 accident report from the third requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Furthermore, although you also assert section 552.108 of the Government Code to withhold this information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c-1) prevails and the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Therefore, the department must release the redacted CR-3 accident report to the third requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code.

We note the first and second requestors are persons listed under section 550.065(c). You seek to withhold dates of birth of public citizens in the CR-3 accident report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we note a statutory right of access prevails over the common law. *See CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle). Thus, no portion of the CR-3 accident report may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy. Furthermore, although you also assert section 552.108 of the Government Code to withhold the information, as noted above, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 613 at 4, 451. Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestors' statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the department must generally release the accident

report to the first and second requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

You also claim portions of the submitted CR-3 accident report must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). As noted above, where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas*, 555 S.W. 2d at 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). Further, as noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See* *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) (“more specific statute controls over the more general”); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451. Section 550.065(c) specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue. However, section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Additionally, we note section 550.065(c) is the later enacted statute. *See* Gov't Code § 311.025(a) (if statutes enacted at different sessions of legislature are irreconcilable, the statute latest in enactment prevails). Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065(c) is more specific than, and prevails over, the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the accident report from the first and second requestors under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the redacted CR-3 accident report to the third requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code and must release the entirety of the CR-3 accident report to the first and second requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Tim Neal". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "T" and "N".

Tim Neal  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

TN/tdw

Ref: ID# 672933

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 3 Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)