



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 30, 2017

Ms. Sharbel Sfeir
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2017-14717

Dear Ms. Sfeir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 664154 (TDCJ# ZT0019).

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for the personnel file of and grievances filed by the requestor, grievances filed against two named employees, and a specified e-mail. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note most of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information contains completed investigations and evaluations that are subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). The department must release the information at issue pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code for the information subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1), this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, none of the information subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1) may be withheld under section 552.103. We note the information at issue contains information subject to sections 552.102, 552.117, and 552.136 of the Government Code.¹ Accordingly, we will address these exceptions for the information subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). We will also address your argument under section 552.103 for the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(1).

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding);

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Heard v. Houston Post Co., 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

You state, and provide documentation showing, a lawsuit styled *Willow Anita Kreucher v. Texas Department of Criminal Justice, Parole Division*, Cause No. 1:17-cv-00339-RP was pending against the department in the United States District Court for the Western District of Texas when it received the instant request. You state the remaining information is related to the pending lawsuit. Based on your representations, the submitted documentation, and our review of the remaining information, we find litigation was pending when the department received this request for information, and the remaining information is related to the active litigation for the purposes of section 552.103.

We note, however, the opposing party has seen or had access to some of the remaining information. The purpose of section 552.103 of the Government Code is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties seeking information relating to the litigation to obtain such information through discovery procedures. See ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Accordingly, the department may withhold the information we marked under section 552.103 of the Government Code. The remaining information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We note the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the related litigation has been concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address and telephone number, social security number, emergency contact information, and family member information of current or former employees of the department or any division of the department, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(3). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the credit card number we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information we marked under section 552.103 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Patrick P. Mehaffy
Attorney
Open Records Division

PPM/som

Ref: ID# 664154

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)