



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 26, 2017

Mr. Whitt L. Wyatt
Counsel for the City of Colleyville
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, LLP
500 North Akard Street
1800 Ross Tower
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2017-14197

Dear Mr. Wyatt:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 670519 (ORR# 86767).

The Colleyville Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all records related to two named individuals or a specified address. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal

¹Although the department does not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand the department to raise this exception based on its markings.

history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The department argues the present request requires the department to compile the named individuals' criminal histories and implicates the named individuals' rights to privacy. Upon review, we find the department has submitted only information that does not list either named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individuals' criminal histories, and the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Report number 15CP051865 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and therefore we assume no such regulation

exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must withhold report number 15CP051865 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.² See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Some of the remaining information is protected under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. See *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find some of the information the department marked does not consist of motor vehicle record information for purposes of section 552.130. This information, which we have marked for release, may not be withheld on that basis. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold report number 15CP051865 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of the submitted information:

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 670519

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)