



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 22, 2017

Mr. Jonathan L. Almanza
Assistant District Attorney
Hidalgo County District Attorney's Office
100 East Cano
Edinburg, Texas 78539

OR2017-13889

Dear Mr. Almanza:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 662801 (Internal File No. 2017-0029-DA).

The Hidalgo County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for certain information pertaining to all theft by check, bad check, or hot check complaints filed during a defined time period. You state the district attorney's office will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record[.]" unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The submitted information contains court-filed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must release this information pursuant to section

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

552.022(a)(17), unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. As you raise no other exceptions to disclosure, the district attorney's office must release the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested).

You claim section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code for the remaining information, and state this information pertains to ongoing criminal prosecutions. However, you also claim section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code for this information and state the information at issue relates to cases that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on these conflicting representations, we are unable to determine if the information at issue relates to an ongoing criminal case or a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1) or section 552.108(a)(2) to the information at issue. Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”² *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the district attorney’s office must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the district attorney’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Upon review, the district attorney’s office must withhold the bank account and routing numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the district attorney’s office must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district attorney’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney’s office must withhold the bank account and routing numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district attorney’s office must release the remaining information.³

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision Nos.* 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³We note the information being released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "C".

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 662801

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)