



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 22, 2017

Mr. James Kopp
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P. O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2017-13799

Dear Mr. Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 662985 (COSA File No. W162921).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request for a specified incident report. You state you will redact information pursuant to section 552.136(c) of the Government Code.¹ You further state you will redact dates of birth pursuant the previous determination issued to the city in Open Records Letter No. 2016-08566 (2016).² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Section 552.136 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e).

²Open Records Letter No. 2016-08566 is a previous determination authorizing the city to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, including the federal Driver’s Privacy Protection Act of 1994 (the “DPPA”), section 2721 of title 18 of the United States Code. Section 2721 provides, in part:

(a) In general.—A State department of motor vehicles, and any officer, employee, or contractor thereof, shall not knowingly disclose or otherwise make available to any person or entity:

(1) personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(3), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, except as provided in subsection (b) of this section[.]

...

(b) Permissible uses.—Personal information referred to in subsection (a) . . . may be disclosed as follows:

(1) For use by any government agency . . . in carrying out its functions[.]

...

(c) Resale or redisclosure.—An authorized recipient of personal information (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11) or (12)) may resell or redisclose the information only for a use permitted under subsection (b) (but not for uses under subsection (b)(11) or (12)). . . . Any authorized recipient (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11)) that resells or rediscloses personal information covered by this chapter must keep for a period of 5 years records identifying each person or entity that receives information and the permitted purpose for which the information will be used and must make such records available to the motor vehicle department upon request.

18 U.S.C. § 2721(a)(1), (b)(1), (c). The DPPA defines “motor vehicle record,” in relevant part, as “any record that pertains to a motor vehicle operator’s permit . . . issued by a department of motor vehicles[.]” *Id.* § 2725(1). Section 2725 also defines personal information as “information that identifies an individual, including an individual’s photograph, social security number, driver identification number, name, address (but not the 5-digit zip code), telephone number, and medical or disability information, but does not include information on vehicular accidents, driving violations, and driver’s status.” *See id.* § 2725(3).

You assert some of the submitted information contains personal information obtained from the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”). We note this office has concluded the DPPA applies to information in the possession of DPS. Attorney General Opinion JC-0499 at 1 (2002). You explain the city obtained the personal information for use in carrying out its functions with regard to law enforcement. Based upon your representations and our review, we find the city, in obtaining personal information from DPS to assist the city in carrying out its law enforcement functions, is an authorized recipient of personal information for purposes of section 2721(c). *See* 18 U.S.C. § 2721(b)(1) (providing that personal information may be disclosed by a state department of motor vehicles to any entity acting on behalf of a Federal, State, or local agency in carrying out its functions). Therefore, we conclude the information we have marked is personal information obtained from DPS by an authorized recipient and is confidential under section 2721 of title 18 of the United States Code. Accordingly, as we have no indication that release of this information would be for a use permitted under section 2721(b), we conclude the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 2721(a) of title 18 of the United States Code. *See id.* § 2721 (a)(1). However, you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is personal information for purposes of section 2725(3). *See id.* 2725(3)(personal information means information that identifies a person, including an individual’s photograph, social security number, driver identification number, name, address, but not 5-digit zip code, telephone number, and medical or disability information). Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000 and makes confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). We understand the city is part of an emergency communication district that is subject to section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. You indicate the telephone number you marked under section 772.318 is the originating telephone number of a 9-1-1 caller. Provided the information at issue was furnished by a service supplier, we agree the city must withhold the telephone number you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial*

Foundation. Id. at 683. This office has also concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information satisfy the standard articulated in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.³ Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 2721(a) of title 18 of the United States Code. Provided the telephone number was furnished by a service supplier, the city must withhold the telephone number you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

Finally, you ask this office to issue a previous determination permitting the department to withhold information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code without the necessity of requesting a decision under section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.301(a) (allowing a governmental body to withhold information subject to previous determination); ORD 673. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Jahna Ward', with a checkmark at the end.

Jahna Ward
Attorney
Open Records Division

JW/som

Ref: ID# 662985

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)