



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 15, 2017

Ms. Ann-Marie Sheely
Assistant County Attorney
County of Travis
P.O. Box 1748
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2017-13313

Dear Ms. Sheely:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 662427.

The Travis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for certain personnel information pertaining to six named individuals and information relating to three specified internal affairs investigations.¹ You state you will release some information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.114, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.130, 552.136, 552.137,

¹We understand the requestor modified the request for information more than once. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (stating if information requested is unclear to governmental body or if large amount of information has been requested, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify or narrow request, but may not inquire into purpose for which information will be used); *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380 (Tex. 2010) (holding when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-business-day period to request attorney general opinion is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed). You state you sent the requestor three estimates of charges pursuant to section 552.2615 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.2615. The estimates of charges required the requestor to provide a deposit for payment of anticipated costs under section 552.263 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.263(a). You inform us the sheriff's office received the required deposit on March 28, 2017. *See id.* § 552.263(e) (if governmental body requires deposit or bond for anticipated costs pursuant to section 552.263, request for information is considered to have been received on date governmental body receives bond or deposit).

and 552.147 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.³

Initially, we note the requestor has excluded from his request social security numbers, driver's license numbers, and telephone numbers in the submitted information. Accordingly, this information is not responsive to the present request for information. The sheriff's office need not release nonresponsive information in response to this request, and this ruling will not address that information.⁴

Next, the sheriff's office asserts some of the responsive information is excepted from disclosure under the Family Education Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code. The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office that FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental or an adult student's consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act.⁵ We note, and you acknowledge, the sheriff's office is not an educational institution. *See* Open Records Decision No. 309 at 3 (1983) (City of Fort Worth not an "educational agency" within the meaning of FERPA). You do not assert, nor does it appear from our review, the sheriff's office received this information directly from an educational institution. Therefore, the information at issue is not subject to FERPA and no portion of the information may be withheld on that basis. Likewise, we do not address your argument under section 552.114 of the Government Code for the information at issue. *See* Gov't Code § 552.114 (excepting from disclosure "student records"); Open Records Decision No. 539 (1990) (determining the same analysis applies under section 552.114 of the Government Code and FERPA).

Next, you argue portions of the responsive information are not subject to the Act. The Act applies to "public information," which is defined in section 552.002(a) of the Government Code as

²Although you do not raise section 552.1175 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to claim this exception based on your markings in the submitted information.

³We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

⁴As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the arguments against disclosure of this information.

⁵A copy of this letter may be found on the Office of the Attorney General's website: <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/files/og/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

(1) by a governmental body;

(2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). Information is "in connection with the transaction of official business" if it is "created by, transmitted to, received by, or maintained by an officer or employee of the governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity, or a person or entity performing official business or a government function on behalf of a governmental body, and pertains to official business of the governmental body." *Id.* § 552.002(a-1). Thus, virtually all of the information in a governmental body's physical possession constitutes public information and is subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 549 at 4 (1990), 514 at 1-2 (1988). You contend portions of the responsive information are not subject to the Act because the information consists of private medical and financial information of an employee. However, we note the information at issue was written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained in connection with the transaction of official business of the sheriff's office. Thus, we find the information at issue is subject to the Act and the sheriff's office must release it unless the information falls within an exception to public disclosure under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.006, .021, .301, .302. Accordingly, we will consider the sheriff's office's claimed exceptions to disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses federal law such as the Family and Medical Leave Act (the "FMLA"). *See* 29 U.S.C. §§ 2601 *et. seq.* Section 825.500 of chapter V of title 29 of the Code of Federal Regulations identifies the record-keeping requirements for employers that are subject to the FMLA. Subsection (g) of section 825.500 states:

[r]ecords and documents relating to certifications, recertifications or medical histories of employees or employees' family members, created for purposes of FMLA, shall be maintained as confidential medical records in separate files/records from the usual personnel files, and if the [Americans with Disabilities Act (the "ADA")], as amended, is also applicable, such records shall be maintained in conformance with ADA confidentiality requirements[], except that:

- (1) Supervisors and managers may be informed regarding necessary restrictions on the work or duties of an employee and necessary accommodations;
- (2) First aid and safety personnel may be informed (when appropriate) if the employee's physical or medical condition might require emergency treatment; and
- (3) Government officials investigating compliance with FMLA (or other pertinent law) shall be provided relevant information upon request.

29 C.F.R. § 825.500(g). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the FMLA applies to any of the submitted information. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the responsive information under section 552.101 in conjunction with the FMLA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 402.083(a) of the Labor Code, which states "[i]nformation in or derived from a claim file regarding an employee is confidential and may not be disclosed by the [Division of Workers' Compensation of the Texas Department of Insurance (the "division")] except as provided by this subtitle[.]" Labor Code § 402.083(a). In Open Records Decision No. 533 (1989), this office construed the predecessor to section 402.083(a) to apply only to information the governmental body obtained from the Industrial Accident Board, subsequently the Texas Workers' Compensation Commission, and now the division. *See* Open Records Decision No. 533 at 3-6; *see also* Labor Code § 402.086 (transferring confidentiality conferred by section 402.083(a) of the Labor Code to information other parties obtain from division files). Accordingly, information in the possession of the sheriff's office that was not obtained from the division may not be withheld on the basis of section 402.083(a). Although you state the information at issue is confidential under section 402.083, you have failed to demonstrate, and the documents do not reflect, the sheriff's office obtained these records from the division. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 402.083 of the Labor Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You assert the some of the responsive information is confidential under section 261.201. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Upon review, we find the information at issue consists of a report of possible child abuse made to the Child Protective Services Division of the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 261. Therefore, the information we marked is confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a)(1) of the Family Code and the sheriff’s office must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d 336. Thus, under *Texas Comptroller*, section 552.102(a) is applicable to the birth date of an employee of a governmental body in a record maintained by his or her employer in an employment context. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the dates of birth of employees of the sheriff’s office in the remaining information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540

S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Additionally, this office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, we note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov't Code* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Further, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for the purposes of section 552.101. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). We also note this office has found the public has a legitimate interest in information relating to applicants and employees of governmental bodies and their employment qualifications and job performance, especially where the applicant was seeking a position in law enforcement. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 455 at 9 (1987) (applicant salary information is of legitimate public interest because it "bears on the applicants' past employment record and their suitability for the employment position in question"), 444 (1986), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Criminal history information obtained by a law enforcement agency in the process of hiring a peace officer is also a matter of legitimate public interest. Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information you marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, none of the

remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code exempts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.117(a)(1). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee or official who did not timely request under section 552.024 the information be kept confidential. Therefore, to the extent the individual whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. Conversely, to the extent the individual at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, the sheriff's office may not withhold the marked information under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.1175. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the information at issue is subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is

excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we find some of the information you marked does not consist of motor vehicle record information. This information, which we marked for release, may not be withheld under section 552.130.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential."⁶ *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the insurance policy number we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth of employees of the sheriff's office in the remaining information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. To the extent the individual whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the insurance policy number we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The remaining responsive information must be released.

⁶The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Jahna Ward', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Jahna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/som

Ref: ID# 662427

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)