



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 13, 2017

Mr. Peter G. Smith
City Attorney
City of Richardson
P. O. Box 831078
Richardson, Texas 75083-1078

OR2017-13042

Dear Mr. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 662103 (File No. 17-239).

The Richardson Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You state the department will withhold dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2017-00069 (2017).¹ You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. We note the submitted information includes a law enforcement officer's body worn camera recording. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code provides:

¹Open Records Decision No. 2017-00069 authorizes the department to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision.

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). Upon our review of the submitted information, we determine the requestor provided the information required by section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code for release of the body worn camera recording at issue. The submitted recording reflects it was required to be made by law or the policies of the department and relates to a law enforcement purpose. *See id.* § 1701.661(h). We understand the recording is or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution. *See id.* § 1701.661(d) (stating information “that is or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution is subject to the requirements of [the Act.]”). Additionally, we have no indication the recording documents an incident that involves the use of deadly force by an officer or relates to an administrative or criminal investigation of an officer. *See id.* § 1701.660(a). The submitted recording demonstrates it was not made in a private space for the purposes of section 1701.661(f). *See id.* §§ 1701.661(f), .651(3) (defining “private space” for purposes of section 1701.661(f)). We note, however, section 1701.661(f) provides, in relevant part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion . . . of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person’s authorized representative.

Id. § 1701.661(f). While the department raises section 1701.661(f), it does not provide a definitive representation regarding the type of investigation at issue in the recording, and we are unable to determine whether the recording at issue involves an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest. Therefore, we must rule conditionally. If the submitted body worn camera recording involves an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest, we note there is no indication the department has received written authorizations for release from all of the subjects of the recording. Accordingly, in this instance, the submitted body worn camera recording is confidential and must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.661(f). However, if the submitted body worn camera recording does not involve an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest, no portion of the recording

is confidential and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.661(f). In that instance, we will consider whether the information at issue may otherwise be withheld under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (personal financial information includes choice particular of insurance carrier), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). Upon review, we conclude the information we marked meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional motor vehicle record information we marked and indicated, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential."² *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the department must withhold the insurance policy number we marked in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the submitted body worn camera recording involves an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest, the recording at issue is confidential and must be withheld under section 552.101 in

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional motor vehicle record information we marked and indicated, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the insurance policy number we marked in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Kunst
Attorney
Open Records Division

EK/eb

Ref: ID# 662103

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a)(a governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.