



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 13, 2017

Mr. Vance Hinds
Assistant County & District Attorney
Ellis County
109 South Jackson Street
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2017-13023

Dear Mr. Hinds:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 661730.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all reports pertaining to a specified address involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly

¹We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to the named individual. This portion of the request requires the sheriff's office to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains any unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as a compilation of criminal history.

However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information in which the named individual is not depicted as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the individual and may not be withheld as a compilation of criminal history. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state case number 17-00527 relates to a pending investigation and prosecution, and release of that information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the case. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of case number 17-00527 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to case number 17-00527.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded

in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); Open Records Decision No. 434 (1986). You state case number 16-16577 pertains to a criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to case number 16-16577.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include dates of birth or motor vehicle record information. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4 (1976). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff’s office may withhold case number 17-00527 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and case number 16-16577 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

As previously stated, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is subject to the two-pronged test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally private. *See* Open Records Decision No. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.).

Upon review, we conclude the information we have marked meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked and all public citizens’ dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find no portion of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern, and the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains any unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff's office may withhold case number 17-00527 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and case number 16-16577 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked and all public citizens' dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kieran Hillis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/sb

Ref: ID# 661730

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)