



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 13, 2017

Ms. Jennifer Burnett
Attorney & Public Information Coordinator
Office of General Counsel
The University of Texas System
210 West 7th Street
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2017-12977

Dear Ms. Burnett:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 662159 (ORR# 174895).

The University of Texas at Arlington (the "university") received a request for the personnel file of a named university employee. The university states it will redact employees' dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2016-18132 (2016).¹ The university also states it will withhold information subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code as permitted by section 552.024(c) of the Government Code.² The university states it will release some of the requested information. The university claims some of the submitted information does not consist of public information subject to the Act. The university also claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Open Records Letter No. 2016-18132 authorizes the university to withhold employees' dates of birth under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision.

²Section 552.117 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.024 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold information subject to section 552.117 without requesting a decision from this office if the current or former employee or official chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See id.* § 552.024(c).

Initially, the university asserts the University of Texas Electronic Identification Numbers (“UTEIDs”) and associated barcodes contained in the submitted documents are not subject to the Act. The Act applies only to “public information.” See Gov’t Code § 552.021. Section 552.002(a) defines “public information” as:

[I]nformation that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

(1) by a governmental body;

(2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer’s or employee’s official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Id. § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. The university informs our office that when combined with an individual’s password, a UTEID serves as the required log-on protocol to access the computer mainframe, which is the university’s centralized hub that runs all its high-level electronic functions. The university states the UTEIDs and barcodes are used solely to access the university’s computer mainframe and they have no other significance other than their use as tools for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public information. Based on your representations and our review, we find the UTEIDs and barcodes contained in the submitted documents do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, we conclude the UTEIDs and associated barcodes are not subject to the Act and the university is not required to release them to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be

highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). Upon review, we agree the information the university has marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the university must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This exception encompasses the deliberative process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of section 552.111 is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, writ ref’d n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1-2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, this office re-examined the statutory predecessor to section 552.111 in light of the decision in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ). We determined section 552.111 excepts from disclosure only those internal communications that consist of advice, recommendations, opinions, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body’s policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *Id.*; *see also City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body’s policymaking functions do include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body’s policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995).

Further, section 552.111 does not protect facts and written observations of facts and events that are severable from advice, opinions, and recommendations. *Arlington Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 37 S.W.3d 152 (Tex. App.—Austin 2001, no pet.); *see* ORD 615 at 5. But if factual information is so inextricably intertwined with material involving advice, opinion, or recommendation as to make severance of the factual data impractical, the factual

information also may be withheld under section 552.111. *See* Open Records Decision No. 313 at 3 (1982).

The university states the information it has marked consists of a communication between university employees regarding policy issues, including the structure, leadership, and strategic goals of a university office. The university explains this information is reflective of the deliberative process by which the university creates feasible policy decisions. Thus, the university states the information at issue consists of recommendations regarding administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the university's policy mission. Based on these representations and our review of the information at issue, we find the university has demonstrated the information at issue consist of advice, opinions, or recommendations on the policymaking matters of the university. Thus, the university may withhold the information it marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

In summary, the UTEIDs and associated barcodes within the submitted information are not subject to the Act and the university is not required to release them to the requestor. The university must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The university may withhold the information it marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code. The university must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 662159

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)