



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 30, 2017

Ms. Delietrice Henry
Open Records Assistant
City of Plano
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2017-11777

Dear Ms. Henry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 660004 (ORR# PRID031417).

The City of Plano (the "city") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual. You state you have released some of the information. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the city to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning a named individual. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must generally withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Federal Bureau of Investigation's Joint Terrorism Task Force (the "FBI") and may have a right of access to the information at issue. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides, "[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety (the "DPS")] any criminal history record information ["CHRI"] maintained by the [DPS] about a person." Gov't Code § 411.089(a). Additionally, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [DPS] [CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). A representative of a criminal justice agency is authorized to obtain CHRI from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.083(c); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Thus, if the requestor in this instance represents a "criminal justice agency," she is authorized to obtain CHRI from the department pursuant to section 411.089(a), but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov't Code §§ 411.083(c), .089(a).

Section 411.082 defines a "criminal justice agency" as including "a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice." *Id.* § 411.082(3)(A). "Administration of criminal justice" has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *Id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 defines "administration of criminal justice" as the "performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender." Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1).

We understand the FBI is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(3)(A). We also understand, to the extent the information at issue exists, it will be used for criminal justice purposes because the requestor states the FBI is conducting an investigation of the individual named in the request. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant, the city must make available to the requestor the CHRI from those records that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Furthermore, to the extent it exists, the city must withhold any remaining information listing the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/sdk

Ref: ID# 660004

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)