



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 30, 2017

Ms. Elizabeth Reynolds
Paralegal
Office of the City Attorney
City of Dallas
1500 Marilla Street, Room 7DN
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2017-11689

Dear Ms. Reynolds:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 665405 (ORR# C003167).

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for information related to a specified incident. We understand the city will redact public citizens' dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2017-09757 (2017).¹ The city states it will release some of the requested information. The city claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the city claims and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹Open Records Letter No. 2017-09757 authorizes the city to withhold public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a ruling from this office.

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). Upon review, we agree the information the city marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the city must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Some of the information the city marked, which we have marked for release, does not consist of motor vehicle record information and may not be withheld under section 552.130. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). The city states the employee identification number it marked is used in conjunction with one additional digit to access city credit union bank accounts. This office has also determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. We therefore conclude the city must withhold the employee identification numbers and insurance policy numbers it marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must

withhold the employee identification numbers and insurance policy numbers it marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 665405

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)