



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 24, 2017

Ms. Yvette Aguilar
Assistant City Attorney
Legal Department
City of Corpus Christi
P.O. Box 9277
Corpus Christi, Texas 78469-9277

OR2017-11408

Dear Ms. Aguilar:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 659225 (CCPD File No. MMor4).

The Corpus Christi Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports pertaining to three named individuals during a specified time period. We understand you will redact motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2016-00831 (2016).¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Letter No. 2016-00831 is a previous determination issued to the department authorizing the department to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision. *See id.* § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individuals named in the request, thus implicating these individuals’ right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as a compilation of criminal history. However, we note the department has submitted information that does not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not consist of a compilation of these individuals’ criminal histories, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy on that basis. Therefore, we will address your argument against the disclosure of this information.

As stated above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987)*. Upon review, we find the some of the information at issue satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/nmd

Ref: ID# 659225

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)