



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 24, 2017

Ms. Ileana Fernandez
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P. O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2017-11397

Dear Ms. Fernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 659158.

The City of Mesquite (the "city") received a request for specified police reports. You state you will redact Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI") numbers pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 (2012).¹ You also state you will redact public citizens' dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 (2015).² You state you released some information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection,

¹Open Records Letter No. 2012-07334 authorizes the city to withhold FBI numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law without requesting a ruling from this office.

²Open Records Letter No. 2015-24970 is a previous determination authorizing the city to withhold public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office.

investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibit 2 and Exhibit 4 relate to pending criminal investigations. Based on your representation and our review, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit 2 and Exhibit 4.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186–87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered basic information). We note basic information does not include dates of birth, motor vehicle record information protected by section 552.130 of the Government Code, or the social security number of an individual other than the arrestee. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold Exhibit 2 and Exhibit 4 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. The city states a portion of the submitted information, which it marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the city must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated any of the information you marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate concern to the public. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, in releasing basic information and the remaining information, we find the city may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold Exhibit 2 and Exhibit 4 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "D. Michelle Case". The signature is written in black ink and includes a long horizontal flourish at the end.

D. Michelle Case
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DMC/eb

Ref: ID# 659158

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)