



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 23, 2017

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldón, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2017-11204

Dear Mr. Gabaldón:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 659128 (City Case #17-1026-8320).

The City of El Paso (the "city") received a request for certain information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report).

¹Although you also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these doctrines are applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these doctrines. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

We note the submitted information includes a CR-3 accident report. Here, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the city asserts section 552.103 for the information at issue, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.103 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the city may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Thus, the city must release the submitted CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Next, we note the remaining information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The remaining information consists of to a completed investigation subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The city must release this information unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You raise section 552.103 of the Government Code for the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1). However, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the city may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code

make information confidential under the Act.² Therefore, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the remaining information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Except for the information specified in section 773.091(g), emergency medical services (“EMS”) records are deemed confidential under section 773.091. Upon review, we find the information we have indicated constitutes records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by EMS personnel. Thus, except for the information subject to section 773.091(g) of the Health and Safety Code, the city must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code.³

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). The city must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exception ons behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³This ruling does not affect an individual’s right of access to a patient’s EMS records from the EMS provider. *See* Health & Safety Code §§ 773.092, .093; *cf. Abbott v. Tex. State Bd. of Pharmacy*, 391 S.W.3d 253 (Tex. App.—Austin Nov. 21, 2012, no pet.) (MPA does not provide patient general right of access to his or her medical records from governmental body responding to request for information under Public Information Act).

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code applies to records a governmental body holds in an employment capacity and excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 of the Government Code not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, a governmental body must withhold information under section 552.117 on behalf of a current or former official or employee only if the individual made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. Accordingly, if the individuals whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality pursuant to section 552.024 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, including the personal cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The city may not withhold this information under section 552.117(a)(1) for those employees who did not make a timely election to keep the information confidential.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked, in addition to all discernible images of license plates within the submitted video recordings, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must release the submitted CR-3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. Except for the information subject to section 773.091(g) of the Health and Safety Code, the city must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. If the individuals whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality pursuant to section 552.024 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, including the personal cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked, in addition

to all discernible images of license plates within the submitted video recordings, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 659128

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)