



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 16, 2017

Ms. Akilah Mance
Counsel for Memorial Villages Police Department
Olson & Olson, LLP
Wortham Tower, Suite 600
2727 Allen Parkway
Houston, Texas 77019-2133

OR2017-10544

Dear Ms. Mance:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 657898 (PIR No. MVPD17-002).

The Memorial Villages Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named individual during a specified time period. You state the department is withholding motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to a named individual. This request requires the department to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information in which the named individual is not depicted as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the individual and may not be withheld as a compilation of criminal history. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides, in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Thus, under section 58.007, law enforcement records relating to a juvenile engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision on or after September 1, 1997 are generally confidential. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a "child" is a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find report numbers 12C058, 15-0099, 16-0500, and 17-0191 involve children engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Accordingly, this information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c). With respect to report numbers 12C058, 15-0099, and 16-0500, it does not appear any of the exceptions to disclosure apply. Thus, the department must withhold report numbers 12C058, 15-0099, and 16-0500 in their entireties under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.² However, the requestor is the parent of a juvenile suspect in report number 17-0191. As such, the requestor has a right to inspect or copy information concerning her child under section 58.007(e). *Id.* § 58.007(e). Accordingly, the department may not withhold report number 17-0191 from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. *See id.* However, pursuant to

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the department's remaining argument against disclosure of the information at issue.

section 58.007(j)(2) information that is subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Thus, we will determine whether the remaining information is otherwise excepted from release under the Act.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state report numbers 10A058 and 17-0191 pertain to concluded criminal investigations that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on this representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include motor vehicle record information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold report numbers 10A058 and 17-0191 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.³

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold report numbers 12C058, 15-0099, and 16-0500 in their entireties under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold report numbers 10A058 and 17-0191 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the department's remaining argument against disclosure of the information at issue.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kaelan A. Henze
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KAH/eb

Ref: ID# 657898

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)