



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 9, 2017

Mr. Will Ramsay
District Attorney
8th Judicial District Attorney's Office
110 Main Street
Sulphur Springs, Texas 75482

OR2017-10027

Dear Mr. Ramsay:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 657201.

The 8th Judicial District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for the entire investigative file pertaining to a specified case. We have reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is not responsive to the present request because it was created after the date of the present request. This ruling does not address the public availability of the non-responsive information, which we have marked, and the district attorney's office need not release it in response to this request.

Next, we must address the district attorney's office's procedural obligations under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, a governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving a request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld,

(2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). In this instance, the district attorney's office received the request for information on February 27, 2017. However, as of the date of this letter, you have not stated the exceptions that apply to the submitted information nor explained how any such exceptions apply. Consequently, we find the district attorney's office failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). In this instance, you do not raise any exceptions to disclosure. However, because sections 552.101, 552.1175, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address these exceptions to disclosure of the submitted information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute, such as the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the

¹This office will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982).* Upon review, we find the information we have marked constitutes a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We note some of the remaining information relates to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. Therefore, we conclude the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).*

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by

the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20, of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. We note Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI") numbers constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. We further note CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the district attorney's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found that common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to

section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.).

Upon review, we find the information we have marked and indicated and the public citizens' dates of birth satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked and indicated and all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code may be applicable to some of the remaining information. Section 552.1175 protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See Gov't Code* § 552.1175. We note section 552.1175 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988)* (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). The district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.1175 if the individual at issue is a licensed peace officer, she elects to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, and the cellular telephone service was not provided to the individual at issue at public expense. However, the district attorney's office may not withhold this information under section 552.1175 if the individual is not a currently licensed peace officer, she does not elect to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), or the cellular telephone service was provided to her at public expense.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, drivers license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *See id.* § 552.136(b). Section 552.136(a) defines “access device” as “a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other

than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.” *Id.* § 552.136(a). Upon review, we find the district attorney’s office must withhold the bank account number and bank routing number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the district attorney’s office must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

In summary, the district attorney’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The district attorney’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The district attorney’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 and federal law. The district attorney’s office must withhold the information we have marked and indicated and all public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district attorney’s office must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.1175 if the individual at issue is a licensed peace officer, he elects to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, and the cellular telephone service was not provided to the individual at issue at public expense. The district attorney’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney’s office must withhold the bank account number and bank routing number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district attorney’s office must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The district attorney’s office must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.147(b).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'SMP', written over a light blue horizontal line.

Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/sdk

Ref: ID# 657201

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)