



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 5, 2017

Lieutenant Joe Wisner
Waxahachie Police Department
216 North College Street
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2017-09719

Dear Lt. Wisner:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 656469.

The Waxahachie Police Department (the "department") received a request for the body camera recordings and incident reports pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a police officer's body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor did not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Next, we note the submitted information was the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2016-14067 (2016). In that ruling, we concluded (1) the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera video recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, and the department need not release the submitted body camera video recordings in response to the requests for information; (2) the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (3) the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code if the marked information relates to an individual who is currently a licensed peace officer and who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b); (4) the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (5) the department must release the remaining information. You now seek to withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides information that has been voluntarily released to a member of the public may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See Gov't Code* § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988). Accordingly, the department may not withhold previously released information unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for the previously released information, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Gov't Code* § 552.007; Open Records Decision No. 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold the previously released information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Additionally, the present requestor has a right of access to information the previous requestor did not. Thus, we find the law, facts, and circumstances have changed since the issuance of the previous ruling, and the department may not rely on Open Records Letter No. 2016-14067 as a previous determination. To the extent the submitted information was not previously released, we will address your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold the date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) This section applies only to:

(1) peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]

(b) Information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, or social security number of an individual to whom this section applies, or that reveals whether the individual has family members is confidential and may not be disclosed to the public under this chapter if the individual to whom the information relates:

(1) chooses to restrict public access to the information; and

(2) notifies the governmental body of the individual’s choice on a form provided by the governmental body, accompanied by evidence of the individual’s status.

Gov’t Code § 552.1175(a)(1), (b). Some of the remaining information relates to an individual who was licensed as a peace officer of another law enforcement agency at the time the information at issue was created. However, we are unable to determine from the information provided if the individual at issue is currently a licensed peace officer. Thus, we must rule conditionally. Accordingly, to the extent the information at issue, which we marked, relates to an individual who is currently a licensed peace officer and who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Conversely, if the individual whose information is at issue is not currently a licensed peace officer or does not elect to restrict access to his information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the marked information may not be withheld under section 552.1175.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue pertains to a pending criminal prosecution that is under appeal. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, to the extent the remaining information was not previously released, the department may withhold such information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, pursuant to section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code, the submitted body camera recordings at issue were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code and need not be released to this requestor in response to this request for information. The department must withhold the date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the marked information under section 552.1175 of the Government Code if the marked information relates to an individual who is currently a licensed peace officer and who elects to restrict access to the information in accordance with section 552.1175(b). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. To the extent the remaining information was not previously released, the department may withhold such information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Emily Buchanan".

Emily Buchanan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EB/eb

Ref: ID# 656469

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)