



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 3, 2017

Ms. Agatha Wade
Assistant Criminal District Attorney
Civil Section
County of Bexar
101 West Nueva Street, 7th Floor
San Antonio, Texas 78205

OR2017-09483

Dear Ms. Wade:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 655746 (BCSO No. 16-054578).

The Bexar County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all information pertaining to a specified incident. The sheriff's office claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the sheriff's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

We first note, and you acknowledge, the sheriff's office did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The need of a governmental body, other than the governmental body that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records

Decision No. 586 (1991). Because you inform us the Bexar County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the sheriff's office may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. In addition, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will also address the applicability of these sections to the submitted information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

The submitted information includes a CR-3 accident report form. Here, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the sheriff's office asserts section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the sheriff's office may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the sheriff's office must release the accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Next, the remaining information includes information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although the sheriff's office seeks to withhold

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17), which we have marked, under section 552.108. However, we note some of this information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Because section 552.130 makes information confidential under the Act, we will address the applicability of this section to the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17). We will also address the district attorney's office's argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the remaining information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The sheriff's office states the district attorney's office objects to the release of the information at issue because it pertains to an ongoing criminal investigation. Based on these representations and our review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the CR-3 accident report, the information we have marked under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, and the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must release the CR-3 accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. The sheriff's office must release the information we have marked under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. In releasing the information we have marked under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RSH/som

Ref: ID# 655746

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)