



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 26, 2017

Ms. Michelle Buendia
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar Street
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2017-08891

Dear Ms. Buendia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 654733 (ORR # 2016-14099).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department will release some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note some of the requested information may have been the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2016-13219 (2016). We have no indication the law, facts, or circumstances on which the prior ruling was based have changed. Thus, to the extent the requested information is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon, the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2016-13219 as a previous determination and

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

withhold or release the identical information at issue in accordance with that ruling. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in a prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). However, to the extent the requested information is not subject to the previous ruling, we will consider the submitted arguments against disclosure of the information at issue.

Next, we must address the department's procedural obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). Furthermore, section 552.301(e) requires the governmental body to submit to the attorney general, not later than the fifteenth business day after the date of the receipt of the request: (1) written comments stating why the governmental body's claimed exceptions apply to the information that it seeks to withhold; (2) a copy of the written request for information; (3) a signed statement of the date on which the governmental body received the request or evidence sufficient to establish that date; and (4) the specific information that the governmental body seeks to withhold or representative samples if the information is voluminous. *Id.* § 552.301(e)(1). You state the department received the request for information on June 23, 2016. However, the envelope in which the department provided the information required by section 552.301 was postmarked February 15, 2017. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The need of a governmental body, other than the governmental body that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). Because you inform us, and provide documentation showing, the Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code on

behalf of the district attorney's office. However, we find you have failed to establish a compelling reason to address your submitted exception.

We also note the submitted information includes search warrants signed by a magistrate that are subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record" unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although the district attorney's office asserts section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, section 552.108 does not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Therefore, the search warrants, which we have marked, may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Accordingly, as no other exceptions to disclosure have been asserted for this information, the department must release the search warrants we have marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. However, we will consider the argument of the district attorney's office against disclosure of the submitted information not subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The district attorney's office objects to the release of the information at issue because it pertains to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based upon this representation, we find the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108(a)(1) does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the basic information and the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, the department may withhold the

information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

In summary, to the extent the requested information is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon, the department must continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2016-13219 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information at issue in accordance with that ruling. However, to the extent the requested information is not subject to the previous ruling, then with the exception of the basic information and the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which the department must release, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 654733

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)