



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 5, 2017

Ms. Michelle Buendia
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law & Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar Street
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2017-07177

Dear Ms. Buendia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 652018 (ORR# 2016-25577).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports related to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.1175, 552.130, 552.137, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the body worn camera recordings at issue were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.² However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Next, we note, and you acknowledge, the department has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body’s failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The need of a governmental body, other than the governmental body that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). Because you inform us, and provide documentation showing, the Dallas County District Attorney’s Office (the “district attorney’s office”) objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the department may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 on behalf of the district attorney’s office. Furthermore, because sections 552.101, 552.1175, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure, and we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or

²As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your argument against its disclosure.

prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and submit documentation demonstrating, the district attorney’s office objects to the release of the information you marked because it pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable, and the release of the information you marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a sufficient portion of the narrative to include a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney’s office.³

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Because the right of privacy lapses at death, motor vehicle record information that pertains solely to deceased individuals may not be withheld under section 552.130. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Accordingly, with the exception of the information relating solely to a deceased individual, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. Gov’t Code § 552.147(a). You seek to withhold the social security number you have marked in the remaining information. However, we note the individual whose social security number you seek to withhold is deceased. Accordingly, the department

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

may not withhold the social security number you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, pursuant to section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code, the submitted body worn camera recordings were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code and need not be released. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. With the exception of the information relating solely to a deceased individual, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/sdk

Ref: ID# 652018

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)