



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 5, 2017

Mr. Matthew L. Butler
Counsel for the City of Bedford
Boyle & Lowry, L.L.P.
4201 Wingren Drive, Suite 108
Irving, Texas 75062-2763

OR2017-07138

Dear Mr. Butler:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 651953.

The City of Bedford and the Bedford Police Department (collectively, the "city"), which you represent, received ten requests from nine different requestors for all information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We understand you to assert some of the submitted information is excepted from required disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law physical safety exception. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by judicial decision and the common-law physical safety exception. The Texas Supreme Court has recognized, for the first time, a common-law physical safety exception to required disclosure. *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Cox Tex. Newspapers, L.P. & Hearst Newspapers, L.L.C.*, 343 S.W.3d 112, 118 (Tex. 2011). Pursuant to this common-law physical safety exception, "information may be withheld [from public release] if disclosure would create a substantial threat of physical harm." *Id.* In applying this standard, the court noted "deference must be afforded" law enforcement experts regarding the probability of

harm, but further cautioned, “vague assertions of risk will not carry the day.” *Id.* at 119. You explain release of the arrestee’s identifying information would subject this person to harm. Upon review, we find the city has demonstrated release of the information we have marked and indicated would create a substantial threat of physical harm to the individual at issue. Accordingly, the city must withhold this individual’s identifying information, which we have marked and indicated, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law physical safety exception.¹

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue relates to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559, 560-61 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108(a)(1) does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the remaining basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold an individual’s identifying information, which we have marked and indicated, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law physical safety exception. With the exception of the remaining basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/sb

Ref: ID# 651953

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 9 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)