



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 31, 2017

Ms. Charla Thomas  
Deputy City Attorney  
City of Temple  
2 North Main Street, Suite 308  
Temple, Texas 76501

OR2017-06773

Dear Ms. Thomas:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 651657.

The City of Temple (the "city") received a request for a specified case number and all supplements and statements related to that case. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.1085 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

You seek to withhold the submitted information under section 552.1085 of the Government Code. Section 552.1085 provides, in pertinent part:

(c) A sensitive crime scene image in the custody of a governmental body is confidential and excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 and a governmental body may not permit a person to view or copy the image except as provided by this section. This section applies to any sensitive crime scene image regardless of the date that the image was taken or recorded.

Gov’t Code § 552.1085(c). For purposes of section 552.1085, “sensitive crime scene image” means “a photograph or video recording taken at a crime scene, contained in or part of a closed criminal case, that depicts a deceased person in a state of dismemberment, decapitation, or similar mutilation or that depicts the deceased person’s genitalia.” *See id.* § 552.1085(a)(6). We note some of the submitted photographs consist of sensitive crime scene images that were taken at a crime scene as part of a criminal case that is now closed. Further, it appears none of the exceptions in section 552.1085 apply in this instance. Based on your representations and our review, we agree the photographs we noted consist of sensitive crime scene images for the purposes of section 552.1085. Therefore, the city must withhold the photographs we noted under section 552.1085(c) of the Government Code. However, we find the remaining information at issue does not consist of sensitive crime scene images for purposes of section 552.1085 of the Government Code and may not be withheld on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute, such as section 181.006 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides the following:

[F]or a covered entity that is a governmental unit, an individual’s protected health information:

(1) includes any information that reflects that an individual received health care from the covered entity; and

(2) is not public information and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act].

Health & Safety Code § 181.006. Section 181.001(b)(2)(A) defines “covered entity” to include any person who:

(A) for commercial, financial, or professional gain, monetary fees, or dues, or on a cooperative, nonprofit, or pro bono basis, engages, in whole or in part, and with real or constructive knowledge, in the practice of assembling, collecting, analyzing, using, evaluating, storing, or transmitting protected health information. The term includes a business associate, health care payer, governmental unit, information or computer management entity, school, health researcher, health care facility, clinic, health care provider, or person who maintains an Internet site[.]

*Id.* § 181.001(b)(2)(A). The city does not inform us it is a covered entity for purposes of section 181.006 of the Health and Safety Code. Therefore, we find the city has failed to demonstrate any of the submitted information is subject to section 181.006 of the Health and Safety Code, and thus, the city may not withhold any information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides, in part:

(a) A communication between certified emergency medical services [“EMS”] personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex,

occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

*Id.* § 773.091(a)-(b), (g). Exhibit C consists of records made and maintained by EMS personnel. Upon review, we find section 773.091 is applicable to the information at issue. Thus, with the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential and must be released, the city must withhold Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code.

Additionally, section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the city must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold all motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup>

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The city must withhold the photographs we noted under section 552.1085 of the Government Code. With the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential and must be released, the city must withhold Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code. The city must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold all motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Kunst  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

EK/nmd

Ref: ID# 651657

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)