



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 28, 2017

Mr. James Kopp
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P. O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2017-06354

Dear Mr. Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 650757 (COSA File No. W152329).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request for ten specified police reports and any other reports involving a named individual. You state you have released some information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an

individual solely as victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The requestor asks, in part, for all reports held by the city concerning a named individual. This aspect of the request requires the city to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicated the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains any unspecified law enforcement information, other than information pertaining to the ten specified incidents, depicting the individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, such information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have submitted information pertaining to one of the specific incidents. Because the requestor specifically asks for this information, it is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld on that basis. Therefore, this information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground. In addition, you have submitted documents that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Therefore, this information does not constitute part of a criminal history compilation, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground. Accordingly, we will address your arguments to withhold this information.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state police reports 2012-1037440 and 2016-1267554 relate to pending criminal investigations. Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to police reports 2012-1037440 and 2016-1267554.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information dealing with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state police report 2014-0777686 relates to a concluded case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to police report 2014-0777686.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense. See ORD 127 at 3-4. However, the basic information does not include public citizens’ dates of birth. See *id.* Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the city may withhold police reports 2012-1037440 and 2016-1267554 under section 552.108(a)(1) and police report 2014-0777686 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

As stated above, section 552.101 of the Government of the Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find some of the basic information in report numbers 2014-0777686 and 2016-1267554 satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the city must withhold the basic information we have marked for report numbers 2014-0777686 and 2016-1267554 and all public citizens’ dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the city may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ See Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records, other than information pertaining to the ten specified incidents, depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold police

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

reports 2012-1037440 and 2016-1267554 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and police report 2014-0777686 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. In releasing the basic information in report numbers 2014-0777686 and 2016-1267554, the city must withhold the basic information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must also withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kaelan A. Henze
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KAH/eb

Ref: ID# 650757

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the remaining information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).