



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 14, 2017

Ms. Kristi Godden
Counsel for Edinburg Consolidated Independent School District
O'Hanlon, McCollom & Demerath
808 West Avenue
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2017-05288

Dear Ms. Godden:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 649593 (ECISD-16-235) ORR121316D.

The Edinburg Consolidated Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for specified insurance policies and all claims for the last five years for those policies. Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Carlisle Insurance Agency ("Carlisle") and Tristar Insurance Group, Inc. ("Tristar"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified Carlisle and Tristar of the request for information and of their rights to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received comments from Tristar. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

We note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) of the Government Code to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Carlisle explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Carlisle has protected proprietary interests

in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the district may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Carlisle may have in the information.

Tristar asserts the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 402.083 of the Labor Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 402.083(a) of the Labor Code, which states “[i]nformation in or derived from a claim file regarding an employee is confidential and may not be disclosed by the [Division of Workers’ Compensation of the Texas Department of Insurance (the “division”)] except as provided by this subtitle[.]” Labor Code § 402.083(a). In Open Records Decision No. 533 (1989), this office construed the predecessor to section 402.083(a) to apply only to information the governmental body obtained from the Industrial Accident Board, subsequently the Texas Workers’ Compensation Commission, and now the division. *See* Open Records Decision No. 533 at 3-6; *see also* Labor Code § 402.086 (transferring confidentiality conferred by section 402.083(a) of the Labor Code to information other parties obtain from division files). Accordingly, information in the possession of the district that was not obtained from the division may not be withheld on the basis of section 402.083(a). Although Tristar asserts the submitted information is confidential pursuant to section 402.083, the district provides no representation, and the documents do not reflect, the district received these records from the division. Therefore, Tristar has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 402.083 to any of the information at issue. Thus, the district may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 402.083 of the Labor Code.

Tristar also raises section 552.136(b) of the Government Code, which provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b). Section 552.136(a) defines “access device” as “a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.” *Id.* § 552.136(a). Upon review, we find Tristar has not demonstrated its information consists of access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the district may not withhold any of Tristar’s information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Tristar also generally asserts its information is confidential pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. As previously noted, section 552.101 encompasses information that is considered to be confidential under other law. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 4 (1992) (constitutional privacy), 478 at 2 (1987) (statutory confidentiality), 611 at 1 (1992) (common-law privacy). Although Tristar states its information should be withheld from disclosure, Tristar does not direct our attention to any law, nor are we aware of any law, under which any of the information at issue is considered to be confidential for purposes of section 552.101. Therefore, none of the information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

We note some of the submitted information may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit. Accordingly, the district must release the submitted information; however, any information subject to copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jahanna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/nmd

Ref: ID# 649593

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)