



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 13, 2017

Mr. Robert Martinez  
Director  
Environmental Law Division  
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality  
P.O. Box 13087  
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

OR2017-05176

Dear Mr. Martinez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 648707 (PIR# 17-31079).

The Texas Commission on Environmental Quality (the "commission") received a request for Tier Two reports filed by two specified companies. The commission claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the commission claims and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

The commission explains it maintains the requested Tier Two information through the Tier Two Chemical Reporting Program, a program implemented in accordance with the federal Emergency Planning and Community Right-to-Know Act ("EPCRA") and the Texas right-to-know laws. *See* 42 U.S.C. §§ 11011-11050; Health & Safety Code ch. 505-507. As explicitly stated in the federal provisions, the EPCRA does not preempt any state or local law. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 11041(a). Thus, we look to the statutory scheme established under Texas law to determine the disposition of the requested information. Facilities subject to Tier Two chemical reporting requirements must report

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

required data concerning Tier Two chemicals to the commission, the local emergency planning committee, and the local fire chief. Health & Safety Code §§ 505.006(c), (e)-(e-2), 505.0061, 506.006(c)-(d-2), 507.006(c), (e)-(e-2), 507.0061). Sections 505.006(h), 506.006(g), and 507.006(h) provide that all Tier Two reporting documents filed with the commission are subject to the Act. Health & Safety Code §§ 505.006(h), 506.006(g), 507.006(h). Thus, the statutory language makes clear that Tier Two information filed with the commission is subject to all provisions of the Act, including the Act's exceptions. It is this information, that is, information held by the commission as part of the Tier Two Chemical Reporting Program, that we address in this ruling. This ruling does not impact the legal right of citizens to access hazardous chemical information directly from a facility for community right-to-know purposes. *Id.* §§ 505.007(a), 506.007(a). Sections 505.007(b) and 506.007(b) require any facility subject to chapter 505 or chapter 506 of the Health and Safety Code to furnish, upon request, the facility's existing workplace chemical list within ten working days of the date of receipt of a written request. *Id.* §§ 505.007(b), 506.007(b).<sup>2</sup> Violations of chapter 505, chapter 506, or chapter 507 may be reported to the commission for investigation and possible administrative penalty. *Id.* §§ 505.018, 506.018, 507.014; Water Code §§ 7.052(b-4), .1021, .1851.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. The commission contends the submitted information is confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with sections 418.178 and 418.181 of the Government Code. These sections were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code as part of the Texas Homeland Security Act ("HSA"). Section 418.178 provides:

(a) In this section, "explosive weapon" has the meaning assigned by Section 46.01, Penal Code.

(b) Information is confidential if it is information collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity and:

(1) is more than likely to assist in the construction or assembly of an explosive weapon or a chemical, biological, radiological, or nuclear weapon of mass destruction; or

(2) indicates the specific location of:

(A) a chemical, biological agent, toxin, or radioactive material that is more than likely to be used in the construction or assembly of such a weapon; or

---

<sup>2</sup>Chapter 507 of the Health and Safety Code, which applies to non-manufacturing facilities, does not contain a direct access provision.

(B) unpublished information relating to a potential vaccine or to a device that detects biological agents or toxins.

*Id.* § 418.178. Section 418.181 provides:

Those documents or portions of documents in the possession of a governmental entity are confidential if they identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism.

*Id.* § 418.181. The fact that information may be related to a governmental body's security concerns, biological toxins, or emergency preparedness does not make such information *per se* confidential under the HSA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). As with any confidentiality statute, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the HSA must adequately explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of that provision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

The commission states the requested Tier Two reports reveal the quantities and locations of chemicals that are more than likely to assist in the construction or assembly of an explosive or chemical weapon or that put critical infrastructure at risk. The commission explains the location of threshold quantities of hazardous substances and extremely hazardous substances at any Texas facility must be reported to the commission under the Tier Two Chemical Reporting Program. Typically, only that information which would reveal the location of these hazardous chemicals is protected under section 418.178(b). However, in this instance, the requestor seeks the Tier Two reports for two specified facilities. Thus, because the locations of the facilities at issue are already known to this requestor, withholding only that information which would indicate the location of the hazardous chemicals would not effectuate the purpose of section 418.178 and would, in fact, result in the release of confidential information. We recognize the public's legitimate interest in obtaining information concerning hazardous substances stored in Texas communities. However, we must follow the plain language of section 418.178 which, through its unconditional mandate of confidentiality, does not allow us to take into account the public interest that exists in the release of this information. Thus, we conclude the submitted Tier Two reports are confidential under section 418.178 of the Government Code, and the commission must withhold them under section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup> However, as stated above, this ruling does not impact the legal right of citizens to access a facility's existing workplace chemical list directly from any facility covered under chapter 505 or chapter 506 of the Health and Safety Code.

---

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the commission's remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Sean Nottingham". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Sean Nottingham  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SN/som

Ref: ID# 648707

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)