



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 9, 2017

Ms. Ileana Fernandez  
Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of Mesquite  
P.O. Box 850137  
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2017-04981

Dear Ms. Fernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 648565.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified motor vehicle accident. You state the department is releasing some of the requested information, including the police officer's crash report pursuant to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(c) (providing for release of accident report to person or entity listed under this subsection). You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 143.090 of the Local Government Code. You state the City of Mesquite is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.090 provides as follows:

A department, [the Fire Fighters' and Police Officers' Civil Service Commission], or municipality may not release a photograph that depicts a police officer unless:

- (1) the officer has been charged with an offense by indictment or by information;
- (2) the officer is a party in a civil service hearing or a case before a hearing examiner or in arbitration;
- (3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding;  
or
- (4) the officer gives written consent to the release of the photograph.

Local Gov't Code § 143.090. You state the submitted information includes photographs that depict department police officers. You inform us the police officers depicted in the submitted photographs have not provided the department with written consent regarding the release of the photographs. You further inform us none of the remaining exceptions under section 143.090 are applicable. Therefore, the department must withhold the submitted photographs that depict police officers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.090 of the Local Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). We note common-law privacy protects the interests of individuals, not those of corporate and other business entities. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 620 (1993) (corporation has no right to privacy), 192 (1978) (right to privacy is designed primarily to protect human feelings and sensibilities, rather than property, business, or other pecuniary interests); *see also Rosen v. Matthews Constr. Co.*, 777 S.W.2d 434 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1989) (corporation has no right to privacy (citing *United States v. Morton Salt Co.*, 338 U.S. 632, 652 (1950))), *rev'd on other grounds*, 796 S.W.2d 692 (Tex. 1990). Accordingly, any information belonging only to a corporation may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Upon review, we agree some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information you have noted that does not belong solely to a corporation, and the additional information we have noted, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note motor vehicle record information includes driver's licenses and driver's license numbers and states of issuance, license plates and license plate numbers and states of issuance, vehicle identification numbers, and vehicle registration information. However, we note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Some of the motor vehicle record information within the remaining information may belong to an individual who is the requestor's client. The requestor has a right of access to his client's motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code and such information may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information within the remaining information that does not belong to the requestor's client under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the department must withhold the routing, bank account, and insurance policy numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. However, we note check numbers do not constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136, and this information may not be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold (1) the submitted photographs that depict police officers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.090 of the Local Government Code; (2) the information you noted not belonging solely to a corporation and the information we noted under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (3) the motor vehicle record information that does not belong to the requestor's client under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (4) the routing, bank account, and insurance policy numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Claire Morris Sloan". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 648565

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)