



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 22, 2017

Mr. Zachary Brown
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
Office of the Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
4616 West Howard Lane, Suite 250
Austin, Texas 78728

OR2017-03916

Dear Mr. Brown and Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 646630.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified death. The department's Office of the General Counsel (the "OGC") and Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") have submitted separate briefs, as well as separate documents that each seeks to withhold from disclosure. The OGC states it will release some information to the requestor. The OIG states it does not have some of the requested information.¹ Further, the OIG states it will withhold

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

information subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code as permitted by section 552.024(c) of the Government Code, will redact certain information pursuant to section 552.1175 of the Government Code, and will withhold social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.² The OGC claims the information it submitted is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code. The OIG claims the information it submitted is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides that with the exception of any portion of the custodial death report the Office of the Attorney General (“OAG”) determines is privileged, the OAG shall make the report public. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). Although the both the OIG and OGC claim the submitted custodial death report is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not generally apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Therefore, the department must release the submitted custodial death report, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The OIG states the information it indicated pertains to an active criminal investigation. Based on the OIG’s representations, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law

²Section 552.117 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.024 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold information subject to section 552.117 without requesting a decision from this office if the current or former employee or official chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See id.* § 552.024(c). Section 552.1175(f) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact under section 552.1175(b), without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security number, date of birth, and family member information of a peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure who properly elects to keep this information confidential. *See id.* § 552.1175(b), (f). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information indicated by the OIG.

However, we note, and the OIG acknowledges, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information indicated by the OIG under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.134 of the Government Code is applicable to information related to inmates of the department. Section 552.134(a) states that

[e]xcept as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.029 of the Government Code provides, in part, that

[n]otwithstanding Section . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Thus, section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029. Although the inmate to whom the submitted information pertains is deceased, section 552.134 is applicable to information that relates to the decedent as an inmate. Thus, we find section 552.134 is generally applicable to the remaining information. We note, however, the information in question is related to the death of an inmate in custody, incidents involving the use of force, and alleged crimes involving the inmate. Therefore, the department must release basic information about these incidents pursuant to section 552.029.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the OIG's remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

The basic information that must be released includes the time and place of the incident, the names of inmates and of department employees who were directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained by anyone involved, and information regarding any criminal charges or disciplinary actions that were filed as a result of the incident.⁴ Accordingly, with the exception of basic information subject to section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.⁵

In summary, the department must release the submitted custodial death report, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. With the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information indicated by the OIG under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, which must be released, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ian Lancaster
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

IML/sb

⁴We note basic information for section 552.134 purposes does not include the identities of witnesses.

⁵As we are able to make these determinations, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Ref: ID# 646630

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)