



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 21, 2017

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldon, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2017-03818

Dear Mr. Gabaldon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 646469 (City No. 16-1026-8025).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for information regarding two specified incidents involving named individuals. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. The relevant portion of section 58.007 provides:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise,

¹Although the department raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy, the department has not submitted arguments explaining how common-law or constitutional privacy applies to the submitted information. Therefore, we assume the department has withdrawn these claims. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, we find the submitted information is subject to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

However, we note the requests indicate the requestor in this instance is a recruiter for the United States Navy (the “Navy”) and that the individuals named in the requests may be potential enlistees in the Navy. The United States Department of Defense (the “DoD”) is authorized to perform background investigations of persons seeking to enlist to determine the eligibility of applicants for acceptance into the armed services. 5 U.S.C. § 9101(b)(1)(A)(iii); *see also id.* § 9101(a)(6)(A) (DoD is a covered agency for purposes of section 9101). The Navy has a right to the criminal history record information (“CHRI”) of state and local criminal justice agencies when its investigation is conducted with the consent of the individual being investigated. *See id.* § 9101(b)(1), (c); *see also* 10 U.S.C. § 111(b)(7) (DoD includes the Department of the Navy). CHRI is defined as “information collected by criminal justice agencies on individuals consisting of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, indictments, informations, or other formal criminal charges, and any disposition arising therefrom, sentencing, correction supervision and release” but does not include “identification information such as fingerprint records to the extent that such information does not indicate involvement in the criminal justice system” or “records of a State or locality sealed pursuant to law from access by State and local criminal justice agencies of that State or locality.” 5 U.S.C. § 9101(a)(2).

Federal law provides the Navy’s right of access to CHRI preempts state law. *Id.* § 9101(b)(4) (section 9101 “shall apply notwithstanding any other provision of law . . . of any State”). Therefore, we conclude the Navy’s right of access under federal law preempts

the state law you claim. *See English v. Gen. Elec. Co.*, 496 U.S. 72, 79 (1990) (noting that state law is preempted to extent it actually conflicts with federal law); *see also La. Pub. Serv. Comm'n v. FCC*, 476 U.S. 355, 369 (1986) (noting that federal agency acting within scope of its congressionally delegated authority may preempt state regulation). Federal law, however, also provides the Navy's right of access is contingent on the request being made for eligibility or retention purposes, and on receiving written consent from the individual under investigation for the release of such CHRI. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(b)(1)(A)(iii), (c).

Although the requestor may have made the instant requests for information for recruiting purposes, we have no indication the individuals being investigated provided the Navy with signed authorizations for the release of the information at issue. Nevertheless, if the instant requests were made for recruiting purposes, and if the requestor provides a signed written consent for release from the individuals being investigated, then the department must release CHRI pertaining to the named individuals from the submitted information to the requestor. In that event, the department must withhold the remainder of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. If the instant request was not made for recruiting purposes, or if the requestor does not provide a written consent for release, then the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ian Lancaster
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

IML/sb

Ref: ID# 646469

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)