



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 15, 2017

Ms. Heather Silver  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Dallas  
1500 Marilla, Room 7 DN  
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2017-03433

Dear Ms. Silver:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 645754.

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for a 911 call sheet and the 911 audio files from a specified incident. You state the city will redact certain information pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2011-18466 (2011).<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>Open Records Letter No. 2011-18466 is a previous determination issued to the city's police department authorizing it to withhold, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code, an originating address of a 9-1-1 caller furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

<sup>2</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the city has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold it. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason may exist to withhold information when the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third-party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Because sections 552.101 and 552.136 make information confidential, these exceptions provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, and we will address the applicability of these sections to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate the information you marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). You state the employee identification number you have marked is used in conjunction with one additional digit to access city credit union bank accounts. We therefore conclude the city must withhold the employee identification number you marked as well as the additional information we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the employee identification number you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



D. Michelle Case  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DMC/eb

Ref: ID# 645754

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)