



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 1, 2017

Ms. Michelle Buendia
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2017-02273

Dear Ms. Buendia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 643848 (ORR #2016-22174).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request a specified report concerning a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. You have also provided a representation from the Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") claiming sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304(a). We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the department failed to meet the statutory deadlines imposed by section 552.301 of the Government Code for withholding the requested information. *See id.* § 552.301(b), (e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although the department seeks to withhold the submitted information under section 552.108

of the Government Code, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interest and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 based on its own interest. However, the need of a governmental body, other than the one that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under sections 552.103 and 552.108 can provide compelling reasons under section 552.302 to withhold information. Open Records Decision Nos. 586 (1991), 469 (1987) (university may withhold information under Gov't Code § 552.103 predecessor to protect district attorney's interest in anticipated criminal litigation). You provide a representation from the district attorney's office asserting sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. Therefore, we will consider whether the department may withhold the submitted information on behalf of the district attorney's office under sections 552.103 and 552.108. Further, sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code make information confidential and are compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness. Thus, we will consider the arguments under these exceptions as well.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency . . . on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this

subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). The submitted information consists of files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Fam. Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Thus, we find the submitted information is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, we note the requestor is a parent of the child victim. Further, the requestor is not alleged to have committed the suspected abuse. Therefore, the department may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold the submitted information from this requestor. *Id.* § 261.201(k). Section 261.201(l)(2), however, states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Therefore, we will consider the remaining arguments.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, which reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and


(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, the department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jahna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/eb

Ref: ID# 643848

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the district attorney’s office’s remaining arguments against disclosure.