



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 27, 2017

Mr. Sharbel Sfeir
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P. O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2017-01937

Dear Mr. Sfeir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 643307.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for all information of alleged abuse occurring at a specified location during a specified time period. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.134(a) of the Government Code relates to inmates of the department and provides the following:

Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the [department]

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029, which provides, in relevant part, the following:

Notwithstanding Section . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Thus, the legislature explicitly made section 552.134 subject to section 552.029. The department contends the submitted information falls within the scope of section 552.134. We note some of the submitted information pertains to the conduct of department employees. Such information does not constitute “information about an inmate” for purposes of section 552.134 and may not be withheld on that basis. However, we find some of the submitted information, which we marked, pertains to inmates confined in a facility operated by the department and subject to section 552.134. We note, this information pertains to alleged crimes involving inmates. Therefore, the department must release basic information regarding the alleged crimes pursuant to section 552.029(8). *See id.* For purposes of section 552.029(8), basic information includes the time and place of the incident, the names of inmates and department employees who were involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained by anyone involved, and information regarding any criminal charges or disciplinary actions that were filed as a result of the incident. Accordingly, except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”² Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information made confidential by the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002. Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). The records at issue contain medical records and information directly obtained from medical records. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA.

We note portions of the basic and remaining information are subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d at 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information satisfy the standard articulated in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if . . . release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(b)(1). Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect “information which, if

released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin2002, no pet.). To prevail on its claim that section 552.108(b)(1) excepts information from disclosure, a governmental body must do more than merely make a conclusory assertion that releasing the information would interfere with law enforcement. Instead, the governmental body must meet its burden of explaining how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *See* Open Records Decision No. 562 at 10 (1990) (construing statutory predecessor). This office has concluded section 552.108(b) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (1989) (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 531 at 2-3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

You argue the remaining information is subject to section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. You state the release of the remaining information would interfere with law enforcement objectives because it would give the public access to information that could be used to “defeat security systems in place at [the department’s] facilities.” Upon review, we find you have demonstrated release of some of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. Therefore, the department may withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. However, we find you have not demonstrated release of any of the remaining information would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Consequently, the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(b)(1).

Section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of current or former employees of the department or any division of the department, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(3). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information we marked pursuant to section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.

In summary, except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.134 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under

section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department may withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jahna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/eb

Ref: ID# 643307

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)