



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 26, 2017

Mr. Pink Dickens
Assistant Criminal District Attorney
Victoria County Criminal District Attorney's Office
205 North Bridge Street, Suite 301
Victoria, Texas 77901-8085

OR2017-01855

Dear Mr. Dickens:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 643350.

The Victoria County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all 9-1-1 calls to a specified location during a specified time period. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers

used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find a portion of the information at issue, which we have marked, was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect by the sheriff's office. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. Because you do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we find the information at issue is confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC"). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI DPS maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapters E-1 and F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI, but a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. We note, because the laws governing the dissemination of information obtained from the NCIC or TCIC are based on both law enforcement and privacy interests, the CHRI of a deceased individual that is obtained from the DPS or another criminal justice agency may be disseminated only as permitted by subchapters E-1 and F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 10-12 (1990). However, driving record information is not made confidential by the confidentiality provisions that govern CHRI. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B) (definition of CHRI does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find the remaining information does not contain CHRI for purposes of chapter 411. Accordingly, the remaining

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

information is not confidential under chapter 411, and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, we note criminal history information does not include driving record information. *Cf. Gov't Code* § 411.082(2)(B). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to

²Section 552.102(a) exempts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." *Gov't Code* § 552.102(a).

section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. However, because privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, the common-law right to privacy does not encompass information that relates only to a deceased individual. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Accordingly, information pertaining to a deceased individual may not be withheld on common-law privacy grounds.

Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, to the extent the information we have marked relates to living individuals, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Furthermore, the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth of living individuals in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the sheriff's office may not withhold any information relating to deceased individuals under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Furthermore, we conclude the remaining information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. However, section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals, and the right to privacy expires at death. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; ORD 272 at 1. Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, the sheriff's office may not withhold any information relating solely to deceased individuals under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”³ Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). However, section 552.136 is designed to protect the privacy of individuals, and the right to privacy expires at death. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; ORD 272 at 1. Accordingly, to the extent the information we have marked relates to a living individual, the sheriff's office must withhold the insurance policy numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. To the extent the marked information relates to a living individual, the sheriff's office must withhold: (1) the information we have marked, along with the dates of birth of living individuals, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (3) the insurance policy numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/sdk

Ref: ID# 643350

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴We note the remaining information includes a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a government body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).