



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 23, 2017

Ms. Jennifer Gonzales
Assistant Criminal District Attorney
Hays County
712 South Stagecoach Trail, Suite 2057
San Marcos, Texas 78666

OR2017-01482

Dear Ms. Gonzales:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 642469 (Reference# 16-0846).

The Hays County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual. You state the district attorney's office has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in

courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to a named individual. This request requires the district attorney's office to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the privacy of the named individual. Therefore, to the extent the district attorney's office maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the district attorney's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information in which the named individual is not depicted as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the individual and may not be withheld as a compilation of criminal history. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c); *see id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining "child"

for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we find the submitted information includes law enforcement records involving juvenile offenders, which we have marked, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.007(c). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply; therefore, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note the remaining information contains public citizens' dates of birth, which are excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As noted above, section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found.* 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. However, you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the district attorney's office maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the district attorney's office must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district attorney's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. The district attorney's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kieran Hillis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/sb

Ref: ID# 642469

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)