



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 20, 2017

Mr. Nathaniel T. Brown
Assistant City Attorney
City Attorney's Office
City of New Braunfels
550 Landa Street
New Braunfels, Texas 78130

OR2017-01413

Dear Mr. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 642247 (PD Control No. 3374-16).

The New Braunfels Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual, including three specified incidents. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have not submitted any information pertaining to two of the specified incidents in the request. Thus, to the extent such information existed and was maintained by the department on the date the department received the request for information, we presume the department has released it. If not, the department must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to the requested information, it must release the information as soon as possible).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects

information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request, in part, seeks all records pertaining to a named individual. This aspect of the request requires the department to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records, other than information pertaining to the specified incidents, listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the department has submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. The department has also submitted information related to one of the incidents specified by the requestor. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individual's criminal history, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy on that basis. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of other exceptions to disclosure for this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of section 58.007 of the Family Code). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct at issue. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find Exhibit C involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. As such, this information constitutes juvenile law enforcement records that are confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c). The department does not inform us, and it does not appear, any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to the information at issue. Therefore, Exhibit C is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section § 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). The department states Exhibit D pertains to criminal cases that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which the department states it will release, the department may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records, other than information pertaining to the specified incidents, listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which the department states it will release, the department may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/sdk

Ref: ID# 642247

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)