



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 20, 2017

Ms. Tiffany N. Evans
Assistant City Attorney
Legal Department
City of Houston
P. O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2017-01404

Dear Ms. Evans:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 642056 (GC No. 23879).

The Houston Emergency Center (the "center") received a request for information pertaining to a specified address during a specified time period. You state the center will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.08 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108 may be invoked by the proper custodian of

¹We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

information relating to a pending investigation or prosecution of criminal conduct. *See* Open Records Decision No. 474 at 4-5 (1987). Where a non-law enforcement agency has custody of information that would otherwise qualify for exception under section 552.108 as information relating to the pending case of a law enforcement agency, the custodian of the records may withhold the information if it provides this office with a demonstration the information relates to the pending case and a representation from the law enforcement agency that it wishes to have the information withheld.

You state the Houston Police Department (the “department”) has advised Exhibits 2-A and 5-A relate to pending criminal investigations. Thus, you indicate the department objects to disclosure of the information at issue because its release would interfere with ongoing criminal investigations or prosecutions. Based upon your representations, we conclude release of the information at issue will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.-Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we find the center may withhold Exhibits 2-A and 5-A under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the department.²

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). Where a non-law enforcement agency has custody of information related to a concluded criminal case of a law enforcement agency, the custodian of the records may withhold the information if it provides this office with a demonstration that the information is related to a criminal case that has reached a conclusion other than a conviction or a deferred adjudication and a representation from a law enforcement entity that it wishes to have the information withheld. The center states the department objects to disclosure of Exhibit 6-A because it pertains to a criminal investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on these representations and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code is applicable to the information at issue. Accordingly, the center may withhold Exhibit 6-A under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code on behalf of the department.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides, in part, as follows:

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The center argues Exhibit 4-A is subject to chapter 261. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Upon review, we find the center has not established the information at issue consists of a report of child abuse or neglect nor does the information reveal the identity of an individual who made a report of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect for purposes of section 261.201(a)(1) of the Family Code. Furthermore, we find the center failed to demonstrate any portion of the information at issue was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under section 261.201(a)(2) of the Family Code. Therefore, Exhibit 4-A may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found that common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the center must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note some of the remaining information at issue pertains to an individual who is not identified. Thus, this information does not implicate any individual’s privacy interests. Accordingly, the center


may not withhold this information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Further, we find none of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing information and of no legitimate public interest, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the center may withhold Exhibits 2-A and 5-A under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the department and Exhibit 6-A under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code on behalf of the department. The center must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The center must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PT/eb

Ref: ID# 642056

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)