



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 5, 2017

Mr. Brandon S. Winchester
Staff Attorney
Spring Independent School District
16717 Ella Boulevard
Houston, Texas 77090

OR2017-00376

Dear Mr. Winchester:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 640463 (Spring ISD PIR No. 412).

The Spring Independent School District (the "district") received a request for information related to a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, and 552.137 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

¹Although you failed to timely raise sections 552.102 and 552.137 of the Government Code, these provisions constitute compelling reasons to withhold information, and we will consider your arguments under these exceptions. See Gov't Code § 552.301, .302.

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information protected by federal law, such as section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Section 1324a governs I-9 forms and their related documents. This section provides an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the submitted I-9 form in this instance would be "for purposes other than enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, we conclude the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.²

You assert the submitted W-9 form is confidential under section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, which is encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. Prior decisions of this office have held section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code

²As our ruling is dispositive to the information at issue, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

renders tax return information confidential. Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms), 226 (1979) (W-2 forms). Section 6103(b) defines the term “return information” as “a taxpayer’s identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, liabilities, net worth, tax liability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments . . . or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary [of the Treasury] with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability . . . for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense[.]” See 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2)(A). Federal courts have construed the term “return information” expansively to include any information gathered by the Internal Revenue Service regarding a taxpayer’s liability under title 26 of the United States Code. See *Mallas v. Kolak*, 721 F. Supp. 748, 754 (M.D.N.C. 1989), *aff’d in part*, 993 F.2d 1111 (4th Cir. 1993). However, W-9 tax forms are requests for taxpayer identification numbers and do not fall within the definition of “tax return information.” Therefore, the district may not withhold the submitted W-9 tax form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information made confidential by section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.306 makes confidential L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms required by TCOLE. Former section 1701.306 provides, in part:

(a) [TCOLE] may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCOLE]. A declaration is not public information.

Act of May 17, 1999, 76th Leg., R.S., ch. 388, § 1, 1999 Tex. Gen. Laws 1431, 2219 (current version at Occ. Code §§ 1701.306(a), (b)). The submitted L-2 and L-3 forms were

created prior to September 1, 2011. Although section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code was amended in 2011 by the 82nd Legislature, L-2 and L-3 declaration forms created prior to September 1, 2011 are subject to the former version of section 1701.306, which was continued in effect for that purpose. *See* Act of May 30, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., ch. 1224, § 7. Therefore, the district must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms created prior to September 1, 2011, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

- (a) All information submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.
- (b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Occ. Code § 1701.454. We note some of the submitted information was submitted to TCOLE pursuant to subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Furthermore, the information at issue does not indicate the named officer resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the district must withhold the F-5 forms, which we have marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.³ However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the F-5 History Report was submitted to TCOLE pursuant to subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Therefore, the district may not withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other

³As we are able to make this determination, we do not address your remaining arguments against the disclosure of this information.

states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI the district must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 560 of the Government Code, which provides a governmental body may not release fingerprint information except in certain limited circumstances. *See id.* §§ 560.001 (defining "biometric identifier" to include fingerprints), .002 (prescribing manner in which biometric identifiers must be maintained and circumstances in which they can be released), .003 (biometric identifiers in possession of governmental body exempt from disclosure under the Act). The district does not inform us, and the submitted information does not indicate, section 560.002 permits the disclosure of the submitted fingerprint information. Therefore, the district must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information is not confidential under section 560.003, and the district may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." *Id.* § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.⁴

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law

⁴As our ruling is dispositive to the information at issue, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally private. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 455 at 9 (1987) (employment applicant's salary information not private), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). We also note the public generally has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employment and public employees. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 542 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the district has failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Therefore, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117(a)(1) also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. You have provided a copy of an election form completed by the named employee, in which she timely elected to keep the information at issue confidential. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we have marked under

section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the marked cellular telephone number may only be withheld if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. Upon review, however, we find the remaining information at issue does not consist of information subject to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, and the district may not withhold it on that basis.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code may be applicable to some of the submitted information. Section 552.1175 protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. *See Gov't Code* § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone number, unless the cellular telephone service is paid for by a governmental body. *See ORD 506* at 5-7. Some of the submitted information pertains to individuals who may be subject to section 552.1175. Thus, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 if it pertains to individuals who are subject to section 552.1175(a) and the individuals elect to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b); however, any cellular telephone numbers may only be withheld under section 552.1175 if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular services. If the individuals are not subject to section 552.1175(a) or do not elect to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), then the district may not withhold this information under section 552.1175.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.⁵ *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the district must withhold the insurance policy number, which we have marked, in the submitted information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

⁵The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).*

Section 552.137 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c) of the Government Code. Accordingly, the district must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the e-mail address affirmatively consents to its disclosure.

In summary, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The district must withhold the marked I-9 form and related information pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the marked L-2 and L-3 declaration forms created prior to September 1, 2011 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The district must withhold the marked F-5 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The district must withhold the marked CHRI information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the marked fingerprint information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the marked cellular telephone number may only be withheld if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 if it pertains to individuals who are subject to section 552.1175(a) and the individuals elect to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b); however, any cellular telephone numbers may only be withheld under section 552.1175 if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular services. The district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the e-mail address affirmatively consents to its disclosure. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Erin Groff".

Erin Groff
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EMG/som

Ref: ID# 640463

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)