



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 4, 2017

Mr. L. Brian Narvaez
Counsel for the City of McKinney
Brown & Hofmeister, L.L.P.
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2017-00253

Dear Mr. Narvaez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 640306 (ORR# P001944-101716).

The McKinney Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for any records involving the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides, in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a "child" is a person ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves juveniles engaged in delinquent conduct on or after September 1, 1997. Thus, the submitted information is subject to section 58.007(c). In this instance, however, the requestor is of one of the juvenile offenders at issue. Thus, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning himself pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, pursuant to section 58.007(j)(1), any personally identifiable information concerning other juvenile suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(1). Thus, the department must withhold the identifying information of the other juvenile offender, the juvenile victim, and the juvenile witness, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with

section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code. Further, section 58.007(j)(2) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining argument against disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. We note the requestor has a right of access to his own private information under section 552.023 of the Government Code; thus, it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at (4) (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). The remaining information includes the dates of birth of the other juvenile offender, the juvenile victim, and the juvenile witness. We note the privacy interests of these individuals who have been de-identified pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code are protected. Therefore, the department may not withhold the dates of birth of the de-identified individuals under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the identifying information of the other juvenile offender, the juvenile victim, and the juvenile witness, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor.²

¹Section 552.102(a) exempts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

²We note the requestor has a right of access the information being released. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(e); Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Tim Neal". The signature is stylized with a large initial "T" and a cursive "Neal".

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/akg

Ref: ID# 640304

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)