



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 4, 2017

Mr. Jose Hernandez
Records Supervisor
Edinburg Police Department
1702 South Closner Boulevard
Edinburg, Texas 78539

OR2017-00251

Dear Mr. Hernandez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 640268 (Ref. ID# 93706).

The Edinburg Police Department (the "department") received a request for all call outs to a specified address regarding a named individual. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue pertains to an open criminal investigation. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement

interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you have marked.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense. See ORD 127 at 3-4. In this instance, you have marked the entire narrative portion of the submitted incident report as information you seek to withhold under section 552.108. Accordingly, we determine the department must release a sufficient portion of the narrative to encompass a detailed description of the offense. Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the department may generally withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services ("DFPS"). Section 411.114 of the Government Code allows, among other things, for DFPS to obtain criminal history record information ("CHRI") concerning an individual who is the subject of a report of abuse or neglect of a child. See Gov't Code § 411.114(a)(4), (a)(2)(I). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." See *id.* § 411.082(2).

In this instance, the requestor does not state whether the offender listed in the submitted information is a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child. Therefore, we are unable to determine whether section 411.114 of the Government Code gives the requestor a right of access to the CHRI in the submitted information, and we must rule conditionally. See *id.* § 411.114; see also *id.* § 411.082(2). Accordingly, if the offender in the submitted information is a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, then the department must release CHRI to this requestor. See Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). In that instance, except for the basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, if the offender in the submitted information is not a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, then except for the basic information, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of

private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold the dates of birth you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, we find the department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the offender in the submitted information is a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, then the department must release CHRI pertaining to the offender pursuant to section 411.114 of the Government Code. In that instance, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, if the offender in the submitted information is not a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, then except for the basic information, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/akg

Ref: ID# 640268

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)