



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 16, 2016

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldón, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2016-27825

Dear Mr. Gabaldón:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 638242 (City's Case # 16-1026-7870).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for two specified police reports. You state you released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

¹Although you also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these doctrines apply to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these doctrines. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the information pertaining to case number 16-248001 pertains to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse and, thus, falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for the purposes of this section as a person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Because the department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Thus, the information pertaining to case number 16-248001 is generally confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code.

We note the requestor is an investigator from the El Paso County Public Defender’s Office (the “public defender’s office”). Section 261.201(a) provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” *Id.* § 261.201(a). Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. Section 411.1272 of the Government Code provides:

The office of capital and forensic writs and a public defender’s office are entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated . . . by the public defender’s office has been appointed.

Gov’t Code § 411.1272. “Public defender’s office” has the meaning assigned by article 26.044(a) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *Id.* § 411.082(6); *see also* Crim. Proc. Code art. 26.044(a)(4). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides:

(a) Unless otherwise authorized by Subsection (e), a person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2). "Criminal history record information" ("CHRI") is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See id.* § 411.082(2).

Upon review, we find the information pertaining to case number 16-248001 contains CHRI. Accordingly, the requestor is authorized to obtain the CHRI in the information at issue from the department pursuant to sections 411.087(a)(2) and 411.1272 of the Government Code if it relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed and if release of the information is consistent with the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 411.087(a)(2), .1272; *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a). However, this office cannot determine whether the release of the information is consistent with the Family Code. Therefore, if the department determines release of the CHRI is not consistent with the Family Code or does not relate to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department must withhold the information pertaining to case number 16-248001 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines release of the CHRI is consistent with the Family Code and relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department must release the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In this instance, the department must withhold the remaining information pertaining to case number 16-248001 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. Although the department seeks to withhold the CHRI under section 552.108 of the Government Code, a specific statutory right of access overcomes general exceptions to disclosure in the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions in the Act generally inapplicable to information that statutes expressly make public), 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge in statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Therefore, the department may not withhold the CHRI at issue pursuant to section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on your

representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information pertaining to case number 16-248157.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may generally withhold the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

However, as noted above, the requestor is a representative of the public defender's office. Accordingly, the requestor is authorized to obtain the CHRI pertaining to case number 16-248157 from the department pursuant to sections 411.087(a)(2) and 411.1272 of the Government Code if it relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed. *See* Gov't Code §§ 411.1272, .087(a)(2). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for such information, a specific statutory right of access prevails over the general exceptions to disclosure found in the Act. *See* ORDs 623 at 3, 613 at 4, 451. Therefore, if the department determines the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department must release the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information pertaining to case number 16-248157 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. If the department determines the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 does not relate to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, if the department determines release of the CHRI at issue is not consistent with the Family Code or does not relate to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department must withhold the information pertaining to case number 16-248001 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines release of the CHRI at issue is consistent with the Family Code and relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department must release the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In this instance, the department

must withhold the remaining information pertaining to case number 16-248001 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the department determines the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department must release the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information pertaining to case number 16-248157 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. If the department determines the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 does not relate to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information pertaining to case number 16-248157 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Meagan J. Conway
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MJC/akg

Ref: ID# 638242

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)