



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 15, 2016

Ms. Michelle Buendia  
Assistant City Attorney  
Criminal Law & Police Section  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2016-27792

Dear Ms. Buendia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 638240 (ORR# 2016-21698).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent

---

<sup>1</sup>We note the department did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Nonetheless, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider their applicability to the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

<sup>2</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find the submitted information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. However, we note the requestor, who is not alleged to have committed the abuse, may be a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim named in the information at issue. As we are unable to make this determination based on the information submitted, we must rule conditionally. If the department determines the requestor is not a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, the submitted information must be withheld in its entirety

under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the department determines the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, the submitted information may not be withheld on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). We also note section 261.201(l)(2) states that any information excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Thus, we will consider your remaining arguments under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code for the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.<sup>3</sup> *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. We note the requestor has a right of access to her own date of birth and the date of birth of her juvenile child. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, with the exception of the requestor's and her child's date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note some of the motor vehicle record information you marked may belong to the requestor, and, as such, the requestor may have a right of access to such information. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. However, because we are unable to determine whether the information at issue belongs

---

<sup>3</sup>Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

to the requestor, we must rule conditionally. To the extent the motor vehicle record information you marked belongs to the requestor, the department must release it under section 552.023 of the Government Code. To the extent the motor vehicle record information you marked does not belong to the requestor, the department must withhold it under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the requestor is not a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, the department must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the requestor is a parent, managing conservator, or legal representative of the child victim, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. In that event, with the exception of the requestor's and her child's date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the information does not belong to the requestor, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.<sup>4</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kenny Moreland  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KJM/akg

---

<sup>4</sup>We note the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released. See Fam. Code § 261.201(k); Gov't Code § 552.023. Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

Ref: ID# 638240

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)