



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 30, 2016

Mr. Adam Anderson
Assistant County Attorney
Montgomery County Attorney's Office
501 North Thompson, Suite 300
Conroe, Texas 77301

OR2016-26510

Dear Mr. Anderson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 635934.

The Montgomery County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual at a specified address during a specified time period. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in

courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to a named individual. This request requires the sheriff's office to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the privacy of the named individual. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must generally withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, the requestor is a representative of the Friendswood Police Department (the "department"). Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides "[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS")] any criminal history record information ["CHRI"] maintained by the [DPS] about a person." Gov't Code § 411.089(a); *see also id.* § 411.083(b)(1) (providing DPS shall grant criminal justice agencies access to CHRI). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [DPS CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See id.* § 411.082(2). A criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI). Section 411.082 defines a "criminal justice agency" as including "a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]" Gov't Code § 411.082(3)(A). "Administration of criminal justice" has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 defines "administration of criminal justice" as the "performance of any of the following activities:

detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI].” Crim. Proc. Code art. 60.01(1).

We understand the department is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). However, we are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use any CHRI, to the extent it exists, for a criminal justice purpose. Therefore, if the sheriff’s office (1) maintains unspecified law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant and (2) determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose, then the sheriff’s office must make available to the requestor the information from any such records that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions, but must withhold any remaining information listing the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Further, although the sheriff’s office claims some of this information, to the extent it exists, is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, a specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). However, if the sheriff’s office determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose, then the requestor does not have a right of access to any CHRI under section 411.089. In that event, to the extent the sheriff’s office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff’s office must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Meredith L. Coffman', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Meredith L. Coffman
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MLC/bw

Ref: ID# 635934

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)