



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 29, 2016

Mr. Zachary Brown
Assistant General Counsel
TDCJ - Office of the General Counsel
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
TDCJ - Office of the Inspector General
4616 West Howard Lane, Suite 250
Austin, Texas 78728

OR2016-26413

Dear Mr. Brown and Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 636230 (OIG Open Records# 2016-00176).

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received two requests from a single requestor for information pertaining to a specified death. The department's Office of the General Counsel (the "OGC") and Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") have submitted separate briefs, as well as separate documents that each seeks to withhold from disclosure. The OGC states it will release some information to the requestor. The OIG states it does not possess information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ The OGC claims the information it submitted is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.134 of

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

the Government Code. The OIG claims the information it submitted is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, 552.117, 552.1175, 552.134, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the information submitted by the OIG includes a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides that with the exception of any portion of the custodial death report the Office of the Attorney General (“OAG”) determines is privileged, the OAG shall make the report public. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). Although the OIG claims the submitted custodial death report is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.134 of the Government Code, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not generally apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Therefore, the department must release the submitted custodial death report, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Next, we note the information submitted by the OIG includes a court-filed document. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record[,]” unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although the OIG raises section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, this exception is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17), which we have marked, under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, the OIG raises section 552.134 of the Government Code for this information, which makes information confidential for purposes of section 552.022. Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of this exception to the court-filed document subject to section 552.022(a)(17). Further, we will address the OIG’s arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.134 of the Government Code is applicable to information related to inmates of the department. Section 552.134(a) states that

[e]xcept as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov’t Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.029 of the Government Code provides, in part, that

[n]otwithstanding Section . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Thus, section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029. Although the inmate to whom the submitted information pertains is deceased, section 552.134 is applicable to information that relates to the decedent as an inmate. Thus, we find section 552.134 is generally applicable to the remaining information. We note, however, the information in question is related to the death of an inmate in custody. Therefore, the department must release basic information about the inmate's death pursuant to section 552.029. The basic information that must be released includes the time and place of the incident, the names of inmates and of department employees who were involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained by anyone involved, and information regarding any criminal charges or disciplinary actions that were filed as a result of the incident. Accordingly, except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.²

In summary, the department must release the submitted custodial death report, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Except for the basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, which must be released, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²As we are able to make these determinations, we need not address your other arguments against disclosure of this information. We note basic information under section 552.029(8) corresponds to the basic front-page information that may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-88 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KSM/eb

Ref: ID# 636230

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)