



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 22, 2016

Mr. Michael B. Gary
Legal Counsel
Smith County Appraisal District
245 South Southeast Loop 323
Tyler, Texas 75702

OR2016-25988

Dear Mr. Gary:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 635255.

The Smith County Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for appraisals, supporting data for appraisals, and contracts for appraisal services pertaining to the appraisal of a specified commercial property. You claim the submitted information is exempted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹ We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we note you have not submitted any information responsive to the request for contracts for appraisal services. To the extent any information responsive to this portion of the request existed on the date the district received the request, we assume the district has released it. If the district has not released any such information, it must do so at this time. *See id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

We note that the submitted information was prepared for the district by Capitol Appraisal Group, L.L.C., an outside appraiser. Section 25.01(c) of the Tax Code provides as follows:

A contract for appraisal services for an appraisal district is invalid if it does not provide that copies of the appraisal, together with supporting data, must be made available to the appraisal district and such appraisals and supporting data shall be public records. "Supporting data" shall not be construed to include personal notes, correspondence, working papers, thought processes, or any other matters of a privileged or proprietary nature.

Tax Code § 25.01(c). The effect of this provision is to make public the appraisal and "supporting data" that were provided to the district. *See* Attorney General Opinion JC-0424 at 2 (2001) (section 25.01(c) provides that certain information used or created by appraisal firm must be made available to appraisal district and deems that information public). Therefore, to the extent the submitted information constitutes an appraisal or supporting data for purposes of section 25.01(c), such information is a public record which must be released to the requestor. To the extent the submitted information does not constitute an appraisal or supporting data for the purposes of section 25.01(c), we will consider your argument under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated

on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a).

You state, and provide documentation showing, a lawsuit styled *Delek Refining, Ltd. v. Smith County Appraisal District*, Cause No. 16-1788-B, was pending against the district in a Judicial District Court of Smith County, Texas, when the district received the request for information. Therefore, we agree litigation was pending when the district received the request. We also find the district has established the submitted information is related to the pending litigation for purposes of section 552.103(a). Therefore, the district may withhold the submitted information under section 552.103(a).

However, once the information has been obtained by all parties to the pending litigation, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision No. 349 at 2 (1982). We also note the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends when the litigation has concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 at 2 (1982); Open Records Decision Nos. 350 at 3 (1982), 349 at 2.

In summary, to the extent the submitted information constitutes an appraisal or supporting data for purposes of section 25.01(c) of the Tax Code, such information is a public record which must be released to the requestor. To the extent the submitted information is not made public by section 25.01(c), the district may withhold it under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ramsey Abarca", with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/bw

Ref: ID# 635255

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)