



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 31, 2016

Ms. Susan Estringel  
Legal Assistant  
Texas Department of Public Safety  
P.O. Box 4087  
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2016-24197

Dear Ms. Estringel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 636951 (DPS PIR#s 16-5623 and 16-5840).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified motor vehicle accident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, the department has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold it. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason may exist to withhold information when the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third-party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Section 552.108 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the department may not withhold the information at issue based on its own law enforcement interest. However, the need of a governmental body other than the agency that is seeking an open records decision to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information from disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). Because you inform us, and provide documentation showing, the 143rd Judicial District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 on behalf of the district attorney's office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."<sup>2</sup> Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

Here, the first requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Therefore, the first requestor has a right of access to the CR-3 accident report. Although the department asserts section 552.108 to withhold the accident report, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to

---

<sup>2</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the first requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the department may not withhold the accident report under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the department must release the accident report to the first requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c).

However, the second requestor has not established he is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the submitted accident report is confidential with respect to the second requestor under section 550.065(b), and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code from the second requestor. However, section 550.065(c-1) requires the department to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. Traps. Code § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, the second requestor has a right of access to the redacted accident report. Although the department asserts section 552.108 to withhold the information, as noted above, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 613 at 4, 451. Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the second requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c-1) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the department must release the redacted accident report to the second requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the remaining information is related to an ongoing criminal investigation. You further state the district attorney's office objects to disclosure of the information at issue because its release would interfere with the investigation. Based on the submitted representations, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic

information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

In summary, the department must release the submitted accident report to the first requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the submitted accident report from the second requestor pursuant to section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code, but must release the redacted accident report to the second requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kenny Moreland  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KJM/akg

Ref: ID# 636951

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)