



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 19, 2016

Mr. Ricardo Vela, Jr.
Assistant District Attorney
Dallas County
Frank Crowley Courts Building
133 North Riverfront Boulevard, LB-19
Dallas, Texas 75207-4399

OR2016-23447

Dear Mr. Vela:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 631421.

The Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for twenty-one categories of information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;

- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

We note the submitted information includes court-filed documents subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record” unless it is “made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you raise sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code, these are discretionary exceptions and do not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, sections 552.103 and 552.108 do not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Therefore, the court-filed documents we have marked may not be withheld under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. You claim section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy for a portion of the court-filed documents. We note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public records. *See Star-Telegram, Inc. v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54, 57 (Tex. 1992) (law cannot recall information once in public domain). Therefore, no portion of the court-filed documents may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential for purposes of section 552.022, we will address their applicability to the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17). Further, we will address the arguments of the district attorney’s office against disclosure for the remaining information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to

or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

The remaining information includes a CR-3 accident report form. Here, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the district attorney's office asserts sections 552.103, 552.108, and 552.147 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because sections 552.103, 552.108, and 552.147 are general exceptions under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails, and the district attorney's office may not withhold the information under section 552.103, section 552.108, or section 552.147 of the Government Code. Additionally, although the district attorney's office raises section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy, we note a specific statutory right of access overcomes the common law. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle).

You also assert the accident report is confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* ORD 613 at 4. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code and the right of access provided under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code for the accident report. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887,901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Section 550.065(c) specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065(c) is more specific than the general confidentiality

provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of the accident report under section 552.130.

You further assert the accident report, as well as some of the remaining information, are confidential under section 730.004 of the Transportation Code. Section 552.101 encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, including chapter 552, Government Code, except as provided by sections 730.005-730.007, an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record." Transp. Code § 730.004. Section 730.004 applies only to an "agency" that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. *See id.* § 730.003(1). You have not established the district attorney's office compiles or maintains motor vehicle records for purposes of chapter 730; therefore, section 730.004 does not apply to the district attorney's office, and the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of the accident report or the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

You claim the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the remaining information pertains to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. We note, however, the information at issue includes a DIC-24S statutory warning and a DIC-25S notice of suspension. Copies of these forms were provided to the arrestee. You have not explained how releasing this information, which has been provided to the arrestee, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Gov't Code* § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1). However, based on your representation, we conclude release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

Additionally, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic "front-page" information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the

DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms and basic information, the district attorney's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

Next, we address your argument under section 552.103 of the Government Code for basic information and the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms. Section 552.103 provides:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

The district attorney's office states the information relates to an investigation and prosecution that was pending when the request was received. We note the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information related to litigation through the discovery process. See ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, any information obtained from or provided to all other parties in the anticipated or pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. The submitted DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms were provided to the arrestee; thus, the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms were inevitably seen by the opposing party to the litigation. Furthermore, basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms or basic information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the district attorney's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked in the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms and court-filed documents under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"). *Id.* § 552.147. No portion of the remaining information contains a social security number. Thus, the district attorney's office may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information, and it need not be released. The district attorney's office must release the CR-3 report under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of the court-filed documents, DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms, and basic information, the district attorney's

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked in the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district attorney's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms and the court-filed documents under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Kunst
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EK/eb

Ref: ID# 631421

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)