



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 11, 2016

Mr. Josh Marcum
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2016-22728

Dear Mr. Marcum:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 629809 (PIR No. W053724).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for two specified reports. You state you have released some information. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

¹We note the department failed to comply with its procedural obligations under the Act. See Gov't Code § 552.301(b). However, because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will address the applicability of this exception to the information at issue. *Id.* § 552.302.

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We agree report number 10-80424 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect. Thus, we find report number 10-80424 is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). As you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must generally withhold report number 10-80424 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Probation and Pretrial Services Office for the United States District Court (the “probation office”) and may have a right of access to some of the submitted information. Section 261.201(a) provides that information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance.

Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information maintained by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] about a person.” *See Gov’t Code* § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part the following:

(a) [a] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained

by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). We note criminal history record information (“CHRI”) is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the submitted information contains CHRI of the named individual. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information).

We understand the probation office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). We also understand the information at issue will be used for criminal justice purposes because the requestor states the probation office is conducting an investigation of the individual named in the request. Thus, he is authorized to obtain CHRI from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use the information for purposes consistent with the Family Code. Consequently, if the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI in the submitted information for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release the information at issue that is otherwise subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code and that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI in the submitted information for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold the report in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g) (listing entities authorized to receive section 261.201 information); Open Records Decision Nos. 655, 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 143.090 of the Local Government Code. You indicate the City of Fort Worth is

a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.090 of the Local Government Code provides the following:

A department, [the Fire Fighters' and Police Officers' Civil Service Commission], or municipality may not release a photograph that depicts a police officer unless:

- (1) the officer has been charged with an offense by indictment or by information;
- (2) the officer is a party in a civil service hearing or a case before a hearing examiner or in arbitration;
- (3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding; or
- (4) the officer gives written consent to the release of the photograph.

Local Gov't Code § 143.090. You state the photographs at issue depict a department police officer. You do not inform us the police officer depicted in the photographs at issue has provided the department with written consent regarding the release of the photographs. You indicate none of the remaining exceptions under section 143.090 are applicable. Therefore, the department must withhold the photographs you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.090 of the Local Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy

interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, the department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.³ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, if the department determines the release of the CHRI is for purposes consistent with the Family Code, we conclude the department must make available to the requestor the CHRI from report number 10-80424. In that event, the department must withhold the remaining information in report number 10-80424 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the department determines the release of the CHRI from report number 10-80424 is not consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold report number 10-80424 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the photographs you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.090 of the Local Government Code. The department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, as well as the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.⁴

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

⁴The information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Erin Groff".

Erin Groff
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EMG/som

Ref: ID# 629809

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)