



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 7, 2016

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldón, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
The City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2016-22588

Dear Mr. Gabaldón:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 629614 (City ID No. 16-1026-7692).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified police report. You indicate some information has been released to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law

¹Although you also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these doctrines apply to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these doctrines. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, which reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Thus, we find the submitted information is generally confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

However, we note the requestor in this instance is a representative of the City of El Paso Housing Authority (the “housing authority”). Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) of title 42 of the United States Code, the federal Housing Opportunity Program Extension Act of 1996, provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law, . . . the National Crime Information Center, police departments, and other law enforcement agencies shall, upon request, provide information to public housing agencies regarding the criminal conviction records of adult applicants for, or tenants of, covered housing assistance for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction.” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Section 1437d(q)(1)(C) provides, “[a] law enforcement agency described in subparagraph (A) shall provide information under this paragraph relating to any criminal conviction of a juvenile only to the extent that the release of such information is authorized under the law of the applicable State, tribe, or locality.” *Id.* § 1437d(q)(1)(C). In Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997), this office concluded a local housing authority is a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute to receive criminal history record information (“CHRI”). ORD 655 at 4.

CHRI consists of “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). The Department of Public Safety (the “DPS”) is required to provide CHRI to a noncriminal justice agency authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to a federal statute, executive order, or state statute. *Id.* § 411.083(b)(2). However, the federal law limits the purposes for which a public housing authority may request CHRI. The federal law provides, among other things, CHRI may only be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A); ORD 655 at 3-5. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) states a housing authority shall be provided access to the CHRI “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law[.]” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Based on this language, we find section 1437d(q)(1)(A) prevails over section 58.007 of the Family Code. *Cf. Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law). However, as previously discussed, section 1437d(q)(1)(C) allows a housing authority to obtain access to juvenile CHRI “only to the extent that the release of such information is authorized under the law of the applicable State, tribe, or locality.” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(C). Juvenile justice information is confidential but may be released to “a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute or federal executive order to receive juvenile justice record information[.]” Fam. Code § 58.106(a)(3). Thus, the housing authority may obtain and use juvenile CHRI only in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1)(A). *See also* Gov’t Code § 411.084(2)(B) (stating CHRI may only be disclosed or used as authorized or directed by another statute).

The requestor states the information responsive to her request will be used for a lease enforcement and eviction purpose. We understand the suspect listed in the submitted report is a tenant of public housing. Accordingly, any CHRI of applicants or tenants of public housing that is contained within the submitted information must be released to this requestor in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1) of chapter 42 of the United States Code. *See also* 24 C.F.R. § 5.903 (describing public housing authorities’ access to criminal records). The department must withhold the remainder of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Tim Neal', written in a cursive style.

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/bhf

Ref: ID# 629614

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)