



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 27, 2016

Mr. Vance Hinds
Assistant County & District Attorney
Ellis County & District Attorney's Office
109 South Jackson Street
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2016-21748

Dear Mr. Hinds:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 627949.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for a specified case file. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.1085 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(b)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors if "the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]" *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a concluded criminal investigation that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You state the submitted information relates to a closed criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(b)(2) is applicable to the information you have marked. Thus, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(2) of the Government Code.¹

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). In considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Because “the right of privacy is purely personal[,]” that right “terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded[.]” *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 146-47 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded”) (quoting Restatement of Torts 2d); *see* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death).

Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the sheriff’s office may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked,

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Tim Neal', with a stylized, cursive script.

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/bhf

Ref: ID# 627949

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)